



No. 200

N° 200

Votes and Proceedings

Procès-verbaux

Legislative Assembly
of Ontario

Assemblée législative
de l'Ontario

Wednesday
December 9, 2009

Sessional Day 208

Mercredi
9 décembre 2009

Jour de session 208

1st Session,
39th Parliament

1^{re} session
39^e législature

PRAYERS**9:00 A.M.****ORDERS OF THE DAY**

A debate arose on the motion for Third Reading of Bill 218, An Act to implement 2009 Budget measures and to enact, amend or repeal various Acts.

Pursuant to the Orders of the House of December 1 and 2, 2009, the Deputy Speaker interrupted the proceedings and put the question, which motion was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 56

Aggelonitis	Colle	Lalonde	Phillips
Albanese	Dickson	Leal	Qaadri
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Levac	Ramsay
Balkissoon	Duguid	Mangat	Rinaldi
Bartolucci	Duncan	Matthews	Sandals
Bentley	Flynn	Mauro	Sergio
Berardinetti	Fonseca	McNeely	Smith
Bradley	Gravelle	Meilleur	Sousa
Brotten	Hoskins	Milloy	Takhar
Brown	Jaczek	Mitchell	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jeffrey	Moridi	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Naqvi	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kular	Oraziotti	Wynne
Chan	Kwinter	Pendergast	Zimmer

NAYS / CONTRE - 29

Arnott	Hardeman	Martiniuk	Savoline
Bailey	Horwath	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Shurman
Barrett	Hudak	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	Munro	Tabuns
Chudleigh	Klees	O’Toole	Wilson
DiNovo	MacLeod	Prue	Witmer
Dunlop	Marchese	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton			

And the Bill was accordingly read the third time and was passed.

En conséquence, ce projet de loi est lu une troisième fois et adopté.

The Order of the Day for Third Reading of Bill 175, An Act to enhance labour mobility between Ontario and other Canadian provinces and territories having been called, and the motion for Third Reading having been moved,

Pursuant to the Order of the House of November 30, 2009, the Deputy Speaker put the question forthwith on the motion, which question was carried on the following division:-

À l'appel de l'ordre du jour sur la motion portant troisième lecture du projet de loi 175, Loi visant à accroître la mobilité de la main-d'œuvre entre l'Ontario et les autres provinces et les territoires du Canada, et la motion portant troisième lecture a été proposée,

Conformément à l'ordre adopté par l'Assemblée le 30 novembre 2009, le Vice-Président met la motion aux voix immédiatement, et cette motion est adoptée par le vote suivant:-

AYES / POUR - 56

Aggelonitis	Colle	Leal	Qaadri
Albanese	Dickson	Levac	Ramsay
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mangat	Rinaldi
Balkissoon	Duguid	Matthews	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duncan	Mauro	Sandals
Bentley	Flynn	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Fonseca	Meilleur	Smith
Bradley	Gravelle	Milloy	Sousa
Brotten	Hoskins	Mitchell	Takhar
Brown	Jaczek	Moridi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jeffrey	Naqvi	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Oraziotti	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kular	Pendergast	Wynne
Chan	Lalonde	Phillips	Zimmer

NAYS / CONTRE - 28

Arnott	Hampton	Marchese	Runciman
Bailey	Hardeman	Martiniuk	Savoline
Barrett	Horwath	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Shurman
Bisson	Hudak	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Tabuns
Chudleigh	Jones	Munro	Wilson
DiNovo	Klees	O'Toole	Witmer
Dunlop	MacLeod	Prue	Yakabuski

And the Bill was accordingly read the third time and passed.

En conséquence, ce projet de loi est lu une troisième fois et adopté.

Pursuant to Standing Order 9(a), the Deputy Speaker recessed the House at 10:23 a.m. until 10:30 a.m.

Conformément à l'article 9 a) du Règlement, le Vice-Président ordonne une pause à l'Assemblée à 10 h 23 jusqu'à 10 h 30.

10:30 A.M.

10 H 30

INTRODUCTION OF VISITORS

Pursuant to Standing Order 36, visitors were introduced.

PRÉSENTATION DES VISITEURS

Conformément à l'article 36 du Règlement, les visiteurs sont présentés.

The Speaker delivered the following ruling:-

Le Président a rendu la décision suivante :-

On Thursday, November 19, the Member for Oshawa raised a point of order with respect to the authority of the Standing Committee on Public Accounts to summon witnesses.

To the extent that his point of order touched on specific proceedings of the Standing Committee on Public Accounts, I will say that it is not the place of the Speaker to become involved. The Committee, like every committee of the House, has the ability to regulate its own affairs. Where it needs the guidance or intervention of the House, or when there is a problem it cannot solve itself, the proper course is for the committee to make a report to the House setting out the matter at issue in the committee.

This not having occurred, I can only assume that within the scope of its authority the committee has been successfully dealing with its own affairs to the satisfaction of its members.

To answer the Member's direct and specific question, though, I can confirm that committees do have the authority to summon witnesses of their choosing. Standing Order 110(b) states that "(e)xccept when the House otherwise orders, each Committee shall have power to send for persons, papers and things."

This is a power delegated from the House, which retains the authority to compel attendance or production. There are therefore some practical and contextual limitations on a committee's authority but in general, committees may invite any witnesses it considers to be in a position to offer testimony that will be helpful to the committee in its inquiries.

The Speaker delivered the following ruling:-

Le Président a rendu la décision suivante :-

On December 2, 2009, the Member for Carleton-Mississippi Mills (Mr. Sterling) rose on a point of order concerning his inability to vote from his assigned seat during recorded divisions held on December 1.

The House will recall that the Member had not been able to vote from his assigned seat because a named Member had refused to withdraw from the Chamber on November 30; that Member, along with another named Member, had been suspended from the service of the House for the remainder of the session when the Sergeant-at-Arms indicated that force was necessary to compel obedience. However, those suspended Members were still in the Chamber on December 1, and one of them was occupying the seat assigned to the Member for Carleton-Mississippi Mills during a recorded division on the motion for second reading of Bill 175, and during other divisions that morning.

Members will recall that, in the immediate aftermath of the first division, I responded to points of order and points of privilege on what had happened. Later, in response to concerns that certain Members of the Official Opposition would be unable to vote from their assigned seats because the suspended Members were occupying them, I indicated to the Member for Carleton-Mississippi Mills that he could assume the unoccupied seat of another Member. I made a similar accommodation with respect to the Member for Simcoe-Grey (Mr. Wilson), whose seat was also being occupied by another suspended Member.

The Member for Carleton-Mississippi Mills now asks why I ignored Standing Orders 20 and 28 in making this accommodation. Standing Order 20 requires Members to "remain in their places and refrain from interrupting the Speaker" in certain situations, and to not interrupt the Member who has the floor. Standing Order 28 deals with the procedure for taking divisions; in particular, Standing Order 28(a) states that it requires "five members standing in their places" to force a division after a voice vote, and Standing Order 28(c) states that a Member wishing to vote "shall rise and record his or her vote".

Let me first say that neither Standing Order 20 nor Standing Order 28 specifically indicates that a Member wishing to vote in a division must do so from an assigned seat, and so I did not ignore any Standing Order when I acted as I did. Nevertheless, as Members well know, it is our settled practice that Members wishing to vote in a division do so from their assigned seats.

Speakers of this House have long upheld the practice that members must vote from their assigned places in the Chamber, and so have I. In point of fact though, seating assignments of all Members of the Assembly are ultimately made by the Speaker. In practice, of course, the Speaker assigns blocks of seats and then generally acquiesces in the recommendations of the various recognized parties on their seating wishes for their individual Members. But as I said, ultimately it is the Speaker's decision, as demonstrated by the fact that the Speaker takes full responsibility for assigning the seats of any Independent Members. That being the case, when I indicated that the Member for Carleton-Mississippi Mills could vote from another seat, I was in effect assigning him that seat, if only temporarily.

Additionally though, one has to look at this issue in the context of the nature and extent of the disorder that erupted last Monday. It cannot but have been apparent to any observer in the Chamber at the time of the naming of the Member for Bruce-Grey-Owen Sound that he was acting in concert with a plan understood by his caucus, and participated in by the caucus as a collective. Indeed, the Member for Carleton-Mississippi Mills is one of several members who put themselves between the named Member and the Sergeant-at-Arms, preventing the removal of the named Member from the Legislative Chamber.

As business carried on and the House entered into the recorded vote on Second Reading of Bill 175, the Member for Carleton-Mississippi Mills was seated at a place other than his assigned seat. The Member did not at that point complain either that he wished to vote but might not be able to because another Member was in his seat, or that the Member occupying his seat refused to leave when asked to do so. The confusion that ensued, and the basis of the complaint now made by the Member for Carleton-Mississippi Mills, was to a significant extent of his own making. As I said at that time, "you cannot contrive a breach of your own privileges."

In a subsequent vote, however, the Member for Mississippi Mills and the Member for Simcoe-Grey were again both prevented from being in their seats because they were occupied by the 2 previously-named Members. At this time, the members did draw this situation to my attention before the roll-call commenced, and it was at this point that I made the accommodation I referred to previously.

I regret that my approach inconvenienced the Members who sought to vote from their regular seats, but I hope that they can appreciate that, shortly after the consequences of the mischief being perpetrated by the suspended Members became clear to everyone in the House, I was able to ensure that Members wishing to vote were able to do so. I stand by my approach to dealing with the issue.

In looking into how other Speakers have handled challenging situations in this Chamber, I came across Speaker Stockwell's ruling at page 538 of the *Journals* for April 6, 1997. This is what Speaker Stockwell said:

I believe that the modern definition of Speaker requires that decisions are taken which are also in the best interests of the institution of Parliament. On occasion, in particular when faced with extraordinary circumstances, Speakers may have to intervene in a way, which seeks to enable the Parliamentary process to accomplish the business at hand.... In this House, Speaker Warner quoting Speaker Fraser, said on May 27, 1991 that, "the Speaker does have a latitude to act in exceptional instances".

I agree with Speaker Stockwell's statement. That statement was made in 1997 in the course of the longest voting process in the history of this Assembly. A few months later, the House adopted Standing Order changes that strengthened the hand of the Speaker and of the House in dealing with disorder and the progress of Assembly business. Those changes appear to have been informed by a desire by the House to ensure that disorder does not trump the democratic rights of Members.

I have already provided my thoughts to the House on the events of last week. I will repeat one part of those comments:- "respect is a mutual obligation. There are boundaries to which Members must also adhere and standards of conduct that must be upheld. This is not about the Chair's discretion or the opinion of an individual Speaker. It is about failing to show due deference to this institution and the traditions of civil debate; it is about failing to show due deference to the privileges of fellow members of this Parliament, including members from all parties; and importantly, it's about failing to display an image of parliamentary conduct that the public would rightly regard as appropriate."

In closing, I thank the Member for Carleton-Mississippi Mills for raising his point of order. His concerns do not raise a matter of order, but they have given me an opportunity to reflect on the events of last week, and on how such events might be dealt with in the future.

ORAL QUESTIONS

Pursuant to Standing Order 37, the House proceeded to Oral Questions.

QUESTIONS ORALES

Conformément à l'article 37 du Règlement, la chambre passe aux questions orales.

DEFERRED VOTES

The deferred vote on Government Order Number 31, on the motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Economic Development, was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 54

Aggelonitis	Crozier	Mangat	Ramsay
Albanese	Dickson	Matthews	Rinaldi
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duguid	McMeekin	Sandals
Bentley	Duncan	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Flynn	Milloy	Smith
Best	Fonseca	Mitchell	Sousa
Bradley	Gravelle	Moridi	Takhar
Brotten	Hoskins	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jaczek	Oraziotti	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kwinter	Phillips	Wynne
Chan	Leal	Ramal	Zimmer
Colle	Levac		

NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Shurman
Bailey	Hudak	Munro	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	O’Toole	Tabuns
Chudleigh	MacLeod	Ouellette	Wilson
DiNovo	Marchese	Prue	Witmer
Elliott	Martiniuk	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Savoline	

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

The deferred vote on Government Order Number 32, on the motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Energy and Infrastructure, was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 54

Aggelonitis	Crozier	Mangat	Ramsay
Albanese	Dickson	Matthews	Rinaldi
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duguid	McMeekin	Sandals
Bentley	Duncan	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Flynn	Milloy	Smith
Best	Fonseca	Mitchell	Sousa
Bradley	Gravelle	Moridi	Takhar
Brotten	Hoskins	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jaczek	Oraziotti	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kwinter	Phillips	Wynne
Chan	Leal	Ramal	Zimmer
Colle	Levac		

NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Shurman
Bailey	Hudak	Munro	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	O’Toole	Tabuns
Chudleigh	MacLeod	Ouellette	Wilson
DiNovo	Marchese	Prue	Witmer
Elliott	Martiniuk	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Savoline	

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

The deferred vote on Government Order Number 33, on the motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Finance, was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 54

Aggelonitis	Crozier	Mangat	Ramsay
Albanese	Dickson	Matthews	Rinaldi
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duguid	McMeekin	Sandals
Bentley	Duncan	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Flynn	Milloy	Smith
Best	Fonseca	Mitchell	Sousa
Bradley	Gravelle	Moridi	Takhar
Brotten	Hoskins	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jaczek	Orazietti	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kwinter	Phillips	Wynne
Chan	Leal	Ramal	Zimmer
Colle	Levac		

NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Shurman
Bailey	Hudak	Munro	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	O’Toole	Tabuns
Chudleigh	MacLeod	Ouellette	Wilson
DiNovo	Marchese	Prue	Witmer
Elliott	Martiniuk	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Savoline	

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

The deferred vote on Government Order Number 34, on the motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Research and Innovation, was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 54

Aggelonitis	Crozier	Mangat	Ramsay
Albanese	Dickson	Matthews	Rinaldi
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duguid	McMeekin	Sandals
Bentley	Duncan	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Flynn	Milloy	Smith
Best	Fonseca	Mitchell	Sousa
Bradley	Gravelle	Moridi	Takhar
Brotten	Hoskins	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jaczek	Orazietti	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kwinter	Phillips	Wynne
Chan	Leal	Ramal	Zimmer
Colle	Levac		

NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Shurman
Bailey	Hudak	Munro	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	O’Toole	Tabuns
Chudleigh	MacLeod	Ouellette	Wilson
DiNovo	Marchese	Prue	Witmer
Elliott	Martiniuk	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Savoline	

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

The deferred vote on Government Order Number 35, on the motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing, was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 54

Aggelonitis	Crozier	Mangat	Ramsay
Albanese	Dickson	Matthews	Rinaldi
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duguid	McMeekin	Sandals
Bentley	Duncan	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Flynn	Milloy	Smith
Best	Fonseca	Mitchell	Sousa
Bradley	Gravelle	Moridi	Takhar
Brotten	Hoskins	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jaczek	Oraziatti	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kwinter	Phillips	Wynne
Chan	Leal	Ramal	Zimmer
Colle	Levac		

NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Shurman
Bailey	Hudak	Munro	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	O’Toole	Tabuns
Chudleigh	MacLeod	Ouellette	Wilson
DiNovo	Marchese	Prue	Witmer
Elliott	Martiniuk	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Savoline	

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

The deferred vote on Government Order Number 36, on the motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care (including supplementaries), was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 54

Aggelonitis	Crozier	Mangat	Ramsay
Albanese	Dickson	Matthews	Rinaldi
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duguid	McMeekin	Sandals
Bentley	Duncan	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Flynn	Milloy	Smith
Best	Fonseca	Mitchell	Sousa
Bradley	Gravelle	Moridi	Takhar
Brotten	Hoskins	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jaczek	Oraziotti	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kwinter	Phillips	Wynne
Chan	Leal	Ramal	Zimmer
Colle	Levac		

NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Shurman
Bailey	Hudak	Munro	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	O’Toole	Tabuns
Chudleigh	MacLeod	Ouellette	Wilson
DiNovo	Marchese	Prue	Witmer
Elliott	Martiniuk	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Savoline	

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

The deferred vote on Government Order Number 37, on the motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Small Business and Consumer Services, was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 54

Aggelonitis	Crozier	Mangat	Ramsay
Albanese	Dickson	Matthews	Rinaldi
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duguid	McMeekin	Sandals
Bentley	Duncan	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Flynn	Milloy	Smith
Best	Fonseca	Mitchell	Sousa
Bradley	Gravelle	Moridi	Takhar
Brotten	Hoskins	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jaczek	Oraziotti	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kwinter	Phillips	Wynne
Chan	Leal	Ramal	Zimmer
Colle	Levac		

NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Shurman
Bailey	Hudak	Munro	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	O’Toole	Tabuns
Chudleigh	MacLeod	Ouellette	Wilson
DiNovo	Marchese	Prue	Witmer
Elliott	Martiniuk	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Savoline	

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

The deferred vote on Government Order Number 38, on the motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Community and Social Services (including supplementaries), was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 54

Aggelonitis	Crozier	Mangat	Ramsay
Albanese	Dickson	Matthews	Rinaldi
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duguid	McMeekin	Sandals
Bentley	Duncan	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Flynn	Milloy	Smith
Best	Fonseca	Mitchell	Sousa
Bradley	Gravelle	Moridi	Takhar
Brotten	Hoskins	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jaczek	Oraziatti	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kwinter	Phillips	Wynne
Chan	Leal	Ramal	Zimmer
Colle	Levac		

NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Shurman
Bailey	Hudak	Munro	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	O’Toole	Tabuns
Chudleigh	MacLeod	Ouellette	Wilson
DiNovo	Marchese	Prue	Witmer
Elliott	Martiniuk	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Savoline	

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

The deferred vote on Government Order Number 39, on the motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Labour, was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 54

Aggelonitis	Crozier	Mangat	Ramsay
Albanese	Dickson	Matthews	Rinaldi
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duguid	McMeekin	Sandals
Bentley	Duncan	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Flynn	Milloy	Smith
Best	Fonseca	Mitchell	Sousa
Bradley	Gravelle	Moridi	Takhar
Brotten	Hoskins	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jaczek	Orazietti	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kwinter	Phillips	Wynne
Chan	Leal	Ramal	Zimmer
Colle	Levac		

NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Shurman
Bailey	Hudak	Munro	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	O’Toole	Tabuns
Chudleigh	MacLeod	Ouellette	Wilson
DiNovo	Marchese	Prue	Witmer
Elliott	Martiniuk	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Savoline	

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

The deferred vote on Government Order Number 40, on the motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Tourism, was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 54

Aggelonitis	Crozier	Mangat	Ramsay
Albanese	Dickson	Matthews	Rinaldi
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duguid	McMeekin	Sandals
Bentley	Duncan	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Flynn	Milloy	Smith
Best	Fonseca	Mitchell	Sousa
Bradley	Gravelle	Moridi	Takhar
Brotten	Hoskins	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jaczek	Orazietti	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kwinter	Phillips	Wynne
Chan	Leal	Ramal	Zimmer
Colle	Levac		

NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Shurman
Bailey	Hudak	Munro	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	O’Toole	Tabuns
Chudleigh	MacLeod	Ouellette	Wilson
DiNovo	Marchese	Prue	Witmer
Elliott	Martiniuk	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Savoline	

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

The deferred vote on Government Order Number 41, on the motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Aboriginal Affairs, was carried on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 54

Aggelonitis	Crozier	Mangat	Ramsay
Albanese	Dickson	Matthews	Rinaldi
Arthurs	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Duguid	McMeekin	Sandals
Bentley	Duncan	McNeely	Sergio
Berardinetti	Flynn	Milloy	Smith
Best	Fonseca	Mitchell	Sousa
Bradley	Gravelle	Moridi	Takhar
Brotten	Hoskins	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Jaczek	Oraziotti	Watson
Caplan	Johnson	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Carroll	Kwinter	Phillips	Wynne
Chan	Leal	Ramal	Zimmer
Colle	Levac		

NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Shurman
Bailey	Hudak	Munro	Sterling
Bisson	Jones	O’Toole	Tabuns
Chudleigh	MacLeod	Ouellette	Wilson
DiNovo	Marchese	Prue	Witmer
Elliott	Martiniuk	Runciman	Yakabuski
Hampton	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Savoline	

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

Pursuant to Standing Order 9(a), the Speaker recessed the House at 12:04 p.m. until 3:00 p.m.

Conformément à l'article 9 a) du Règlement, le Président ordonne une pause à l'Assemblée à 12 h 04 jusqu'à 15 h.

3:00 P.M.**15 H****INTRODUCTION OF VISITORS**

Pursuant to Standing Order 36, visitors were introduced.

PRÉSENTATION DES VISITEURS

Conformément à l'article 36 du Règlement, les visiteurs sont présentés.

MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

Pursuant to Standing Order 31, Members made statements.

DÉCLARATIONS DES DÉPUTÉS

Conformément à l'article 31 du Règlement, des députés font des déclarations.

REPORTS BY COMMITTEES

Mr. Prue from the Standing Committee on Regulations and Private Bills presented the Committee's Report which was read as follows and adopted:

Your Committee recommends that the following Bill be not reported:-

Bill 132, An Act to amend the Liquor Licence Act.

RAPPORTS DES COMITÉS

M. Prue du Comité permanent des règlements et des projets de loi d'intérêt privé présente le rapport du comité qui est lu comme suit et adopté:-

Votre comité recommande que le projet de loi suivant ne soit pas reporté:-

Projet de loi 132, Loi modifiant la Loi sur les permis d'alcool.

INTRODUCTION OF BILLS

The following Bills were introduced and read the first time:-

Bill 236, An Act to amend the Pension Benefits Act. Hon. Mr. Duncan.

Bill 237, An Act to sustain and encourage improvement in Ontario's water and waste water services and to establish the Ontario Water Board. Mr. Caplan.

DÉPÔT DES PROJETS DE LOI

Les projets de loi suivants sont présentés et lus une première fois:-

Projet de loi 236, Loi modifiant la Loi sur les régimes de retraite. L'hon. M. Duncan.

Projet de loi 237, Loi visant à assurer la viabilité des services d'approvisionnement en eau et des services relatifs aux eaux usées de l'Ontario et à favoriser leur amélioration et créant la Commission des eaux de l'Ontario. M. Caplan.

STATEMENTS BY THE MINISTRY AND RESPONSES

Pursuant to Standing Order 35, a Minister made a statement and Opposition Members responded.

DÉCLARATIONS MINISTÉRIELLES ET RÉPONSES

Conformément à l'article 35 du Règlement, un ministre fait une déclaration et des députés de l'opposition y répondent.

PETITIONS

Petition relating to zero tolerance of violence on public transit (Sessional Paper No. P-201) Mr. Colle.

PÉTITIONS

Petition relating to a blended or harmonized sales tax (Sessional Paper No. P-224) Mr. Runciman and Mr. Yakabuski.

Petition relating to stopping the 13% combined sales tax (Sessional Paper No. P-235) Mr. Arnott, Mr. Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka), Mrs. Munro and Mr. Ouellette.

Petition relating to cancelling the scheduled implementation of sales tax harmonization (Sessional Paper No. P-244) Mr. Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek).

Petition relating to stopping the closure of independently owned and operated Driver and Vehicle Licence Issuing Offices in Ontario by Service Ontario (Sessional Paper No. P-287) Mr. Runciman.

Petition relating to providing adequate increases in the operating budget of Muskoka Algonquin Healthcare to maintain current health services and provide long-term care beds (Sessional Paper No. P-291) Mr. Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka).

Petition relating to requesting that the current privately operated Driver and Vehicle Licence Issuing Offices of Ontario remain open (Sessional Paper No. P-295) Mr. Yakabuski.

Petition relating to approving and initiating the process to expand the Milton District Hospital (Sessional Paper No. P-298) Mr. Chudleigh.

Petition relating to abandoning the RFP process for school bus companies (Sessional Paper No. P-303) Mr. Yakabuski.

Petition relating to not imposing the harmonized provincial and GST tax on Ontario's hard-working families and businesses (Sessional Paper No. P-317) Mr. Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka).

Petition relating to a full public inquiry into spending at eHealth (Sessional Paper No. P-326) Mrs. Savoline.

Petition relating to initiating a joint process with the Federal Government to reconsider the HST (Sessional Paper No. P-327) Mr. Chudleigh.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

A debate arose on the motion for Third Reading of Bill 168, An Act to amend the Occupational Health and Safety Act with respect to violence and harassment in the workplace and other matters.

After some time, pursuant to the Order of the House of December 8, 2009, the Deputy Speaker interrupted the proceedings and put the question, which motion was carried on the following division:-

ORDRE DU JOUR

Il s'élève un débat sur la motion portant troisième lecture du projet de loi 168, Loi modifiant la Loi sur la santé et la sécurité au travail en ce qui concerne la violence et le harcèlement au travail et d'autres questions.

Après quelque temps, conformément à l'ordre adopté par l'Assemblée le 8 décembre 2009, le Vice-Président interrompt les délibérations et met la motion aux voix et ladite motion est adoptée par le vote suivant:-

AYES / POUR - 66

Albanese	Flynn	Martiniuk	Phillips
Arnott	Fonseca	Mauro	Prue
Arthurs	Hampton	McMeekin	Rinaldi
Balkissoon	Hardeman	McNeely	Runciman
Berardinetti	Horwath	Meilleur	Ruprecht
Bisson	Hoskins	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Sandals
Brotten	Jaczek	Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)	Savoline
Brown	Jeffrey	Milloy	Sergio
Caplan	Johnson	Mitchell	Smith
Carroll	Jones	Moridi	Sousa
Chudleigh	Klees	Munro	Tabuns
Colle	Lalonde	Naqvi	Van Bommel
Dhillon	Leal	Oraziotti	Wilkinson
Dickson	Levac	O’Toole	Witmer
DiNovo	MacLeod	Ouellette	Yakabuski
Duguid	Mangat	Pendergast	Zimmer
Elliott	Marchese		

NAYS / CONTRE - 0

And the Bill was accordingly read the third time and was passed.

En conséquence, ce projet de loi est lu une troisième fois et adopté.

A debate arose on the motion for Third Reading of Bill 210, An Act to protect foreign nationals employed as live-in caregivers and in other prescribed employment and to amend the Employment Standards Act, 2000.

Il s’élève un débat sur la motion portant troisième lecture du projet de loi 210, Loi visant à protéger les étrangers employés comme aides familiaux et dans d’autres emplois prescrits et modifiant la Loi de 2000 sur les normes d’emploi.

After some time, pursuant to the Order of the House of November 26, 2009, the Deputy Speaker interrupted the proceedings and put the question, which motion was carried on the following division:-

Après quelque temps, conformément à l’ordre adopté par l’Assemblée le 26 novembre 2009, le Vice-Président interrompt les délibérations et met la motion aux voix et ladite motion est adoptée par le vote suivant:-

AYES / POUR - 48

Albanese	Flynn	Marchese	Prue
Arthurs	Fonseca	Mauro	Ramal
Balkissoon	Hampton	McMeekin	Rinaldi
Berardinetti	Horwath	McNeely	Ruprecht
Bisson	Hoskins	Miller (Hamilton East–Stoney Creek)	Sandals
Brotten	Jaczek	Milloy	Sergio
Brown	Jeffrey	Mitchell	Smith
Colle	Johnson	Moridi	Sousa
Dhillon	Lalonde	Naqvi	Tabuns
Dickson	Leal	Oraziotti	Van Bommel
DiNovo	Levac	Pendergast	Wilkinson
Duguid	Mangat	Phillips	Zimmer

NAYS / CONTRE - 13

Arnott
Chudleigh
Dunlop
Elliott

Hardeman
Jones
Martiniuk

Miller (Parry Sound–Muskoka)
Munro
O’Toole

Savoline
Witmer
Yakabuski

And the Bill was accordingly read the third time and was passed.

En conséquence, ce projet de loi est lu une troisième fois et adopté.

Mr. Duguid moved, That the House do now adjourn.

M. Duguid propose que l'Assemblée ajourne les débats maintenant.

The question, having been put on the motion, was declared carried.

Cette motion, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

The House then adjourned at 5:52 p.m.

À 17 h 52, la chambre a ensuite ajourné ses travaux.

le président

STEVE PETERS

Speaker

PETITIONS TABLED PURSUANT TO STANDING ORDER 39(a)

Petition relating to a blended or harmonized sales tax (Sessional Paper No. P-224) (Tabled December 9, 2009) Mr. Yakabuski.

Petition relating to amending the Liquor Control Act to permit the sale of beer and wine in local convenience stores (Sessional Paper No. P-277) (Tabled December 9, 2009) Mr. Chudleigh.

Petition relating to the labour dispute between Serco DES and DriveTest (Sessional Paper No. P-320) (Tabled December 9, 2009) Mrs. Van Bommel.

Petition relating to not increasing taxes and not bringing into effect any combination of the Provincial / Retail Sales Tax with the G.S.T. for Ontario consumers (Sessional Paper No. P-323) (Tabled December 9, 2009) Mr. Yakabuski.

Petition relating to oral chemotherapy (Sessional Paper No. P-328) (Tabled December 9, 2009) Ms. Jaczek.

**SESSIONAL PAPERS PRESENTED
PURSUANT TO STANDING ORDER 40**

**DOCUMENTS PARLEMENTAIRES
DÉPOSÉS CONFORMÉMENT À
L'ARTICLE 40 DU RÈGLEMENT**

COMPENDIA:

Bill 236, An Act to amend the Pension Benefits Act (No. 609) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Algoma Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 570) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Brant Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 571) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Chatham/Kent Community Care Access Centre / Centre d'accès aux soins communautaires de Chatham/Kent, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 572) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Cochrane District Community Care Access Centre / Centre d'accès aux soins communautaire du district de Cochrane, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 573) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Community Care Access Centre for the Eastern Counties, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 576) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Community Care Access Centre of the District of Thunder Bay, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 602) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Community Care Access Centre of Waterloo Region, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 605) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Community Care Access Centre of Wellington-Dufferin, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 606) (Tabled December 9, 2009)

Community Care Access Centre of York Region, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 608) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Durham Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 574) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

East York Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 575) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Elgin Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 577) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Etobicoke and York Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 578) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Grey-Bruce Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 579) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Haldimand-Norfolk Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 580) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Haliburton, Northumberland and Victoria Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 581) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Halton Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 582) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Hamilton Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 583) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Hastings & Prince Edward Counties Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 584) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Huron Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 585) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Kenora and Rainy River Districts Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 586) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Kingston, Frontenac, Lennox & Addington Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 587) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Lanark, Leeds and Grenville Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 588) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

London-Middlesex Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 589) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Manitoulin-Sudbury Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 590) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Minister of Tourism, correspondence from The Council of The Corporation of the City of North Bay, dated December 2, 2009 (No. 568) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Near North Community Care Access Centre / Centre d'accès aux soins communautaires du moyen-nord, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 591) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Niagara Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 592) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

North York Community Care Access Centre / Centre d'accès aux soins communautaires de North York, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 610) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Ottawa Community Care Access Centre / Centre d'accès aux soins communautaires d'Ottawa, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 593) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Oxford Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 594) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Peel Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 595) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Perth County Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 596) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Peterborough Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 597) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Renfrew County Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 598) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Sarnia-Lambton Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 599) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Scarborough Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 600) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Simcoe County Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 601) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Social Benefits Tribunal / Tribunal de l'aide sociale, Annual Report 2008-2009 (No. 569) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Timiskiming Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 603) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Toronto Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 604) (Tabled December 9, 2009).

Windsor/Essex Community Care Access Centre, Annual Report 2005-2006 (No. 607) (Tabled December 9, 2009).