

Legislative
Assembly
of Ontario



Assemblée
législative
de l'Ontario

**Official Report
of Debates
(Hansard)**

No. 23B

**Journal
des débats
(Hansard)**

N° 23B

1st Session
42nd Parliament

Monday
17 September 2018

1^{re} session
42^e législature

Lundi
17 septembre 2018

Speaker: Honourable Ted Arnott
Clerk: Todd Decker

Président : L'honorable Ted Arnott
Greffier : Todd Decker

Hansard on the Internet

Hansard and other documents of the Legislative Assembly can be on your personal computer within hours after each sitting. The address is:

<https://www.ola.org/>

Index inquiries

Reference to a cumulative index of previous issues may be obtained by calling the Hansard Reporting Service indexing staff at 416-325-7400.

Le Journal des débats sur Internet

L'adresse pour faire paraître sur votre ordinateur personnel le Journal et d'autres documents de l'Assemblée législative en quelques heures seulement après la séance est :

Renseignements sur l'index

Adressez vos questions portant sur des numéros précédents du Journal des débats au personnel de l'index, qui vous fourniront des références aux pages dans l'index cumulatif, en composant le 416-325-7400.

Hansard Reporting and Interpretation Services
Room 500, West Wing, Legislative Building
111 Wellesley Street West, Queen's Park
Toronto ON M7A 1A2
Telephone 416-325-7400; fax 416-325-7430
Published by the Legislative Assembly of Ontario



Service du Journal des débats et d'interprétation
Salle 500, aile ouest, Édifice du Parlement
111, rue Wellesley ouest, Queen's Park
Toronto ON M7A 1A2
Téléphone, 416-325-7400; télécopieur, 416-325-7430
Publié par l'Assemblée législative de l'Ontario

ISSN 1180-2987

CONTENTS / TABLE DES MATIÈRES

Monday 17 September 2018 / Lundi 17 septembre 2018

INTRODUCTION OF VISITORS / PRÉSENTATION DES VISITEURS

Ms. Suze Morrison	995
Ms. Jill Andrew	995

Legislative staff

Hon. Todd Smith	995
The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott)	995

ORAL QUESTIONS / QUESTIONS ORALES

Government's agenda

Ms. Andrea Horwath	995
Hon. Doug Ford	995

Government's agenda

Ms. Andrea Horwath	996
Hon. Doug Ford	996

Government's agenda

Ms. Andrea Horwath	997
Hon. Steve Clark	997

Taxation

Mr. Bill Walker	997
Hon. Rod Phillips	997

Government accountability

Ms. Sara Singh	998
Hon. Caroline Mulroney	998

Tourism

Mr. Michael Parsa	999
Hon. Sylvia Jones	999

Municipal elections

Ms. Jessica Bell	999
Hon. Doug Ford	999

Government accountability

Mr. Mike Schreiner	999
Hon. Doug Ford	1000

Municipal government

Mrs. Robin Martin	1000
-------------------------	------

Municipal government

Mr. Jeff Burch	1001
Hon. Steve Clark	1001

Government spending

Ms. Natalia Kusendova	1001
Hon. Peter Bethlenfalvy	1001

Anti-racism activities

Ms. Laura Mae Lindo	1002
Hon. Michael A. Tibollo	1002

Economic development

Mr. Ross Romano	1002
Hon. Jim Wilson	1002

Employment standards

Mr. Jamie West	1003
Hon. Laurie Scott	1003
Hon. Steve Clark	1003

Discrimination

Ms. Lindsey Park	1003
Hon. Lisa MacLeod	1003

Affordable housing

Ms. Suze Morrison	1004
Hon. Steve Clark	1004

INTRODUCTION OF VISITORS / PRÉSENTATION DES VISITEURS

Ms. Jill Andrew	1005
Ms. Doly Begum	1005

MEMBERS' STATEMENTS / DÉCLARATIONS DES DÉPUTÉS

Government's agenda

Ms. Bhutlala Karpoche	1005
-----------------------------	------

Government's agenda

Ms. Teresa J. Armstrong	1005
-------------------------------	------

Government's agenda

Ms. Jennifer K. French	1005
------------------------------	------

Veterans' House

Mrs. Marie-France Lalonde	1006
---------------------------------	------

Government's agenda

Mr. Kevin Yarde	1006
-----------------------	------

MOTIONS

House sittings

Hon. Todd Smith	1006
Mr. Gilles Bisson	1006
Ms. Mitzie Hunter	1007
Mr. Gilles Bisson	1007
Motion agreed to	1007

PETITIONS / PÉTITIONS

Social assistance

Miss Monique Taylor	1007
---------------------------	------

Social assistance

Ms. Mitzie Hunter	1008
-------------------------	------

Municipal elections	
Ms. Doly Begum.....	1008
Municipal elections	
Mr. Mike Schreiner	1008
Municipal elections	
Ms. Jessica Bell	1008
Municipal elections	
Mr. Chris Glover.....	1009
Celiac disease	
Ms. Suze Morrison	1009
Social assistance	
Ms. Judith Monteith-Farrell.....	1009
Employment standards	
Ms. Jill Andrew	1009
Employment standards	
Ms. Marit Stiles	1010

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO

Monday 17 September 2018

ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE DE L'ONTARIO

Lundi 17 septembre 2018

The House recessed from 0705 to 1030.

INTRODUCTION OF VISITORS

Ms. Suze Morrison: I'd like to introduce and welcome my long-suffering better half, my husband, Trevor, who has joined me in the gallery today. He was also here with us late into the morning.

Ms. Jill Andrew: I would like to acknowledge Darnel Harris, executive director of Our Greenway; and Diana Guzman, who were here with us last night into the wee hours of the morning. They are both St. Paul's supporters. One is a resident; one is a visitor. We were really glad to have them here.

LEGISLATIVE STAFF

Hon. Todd Smith: Point of order.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Point of order: the government House leader.

Hon. Todd Smith: I just wanted to thank the Legislature's support staff, including our security staff, special constables and all of our procedural staff for enabling this House to hold our overnight debate into the wee hours of this morning. Without them, this hallowed chamber wouldn't have experienced one of the best debates I've had—

Applause.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): As Speaker, I want to echo those expressions of appreciation.

ORAL QUESTIONS

GOVERNMENT'S AGENDA

Ms. Andrea Horwath: My question is to the Premier.

Early this morning, the Premier claimed that Toronto city hall is dysfunctional and focused on the wrong priorities. Yet under his leadership last night, Queen's Park was barricaded to the public, literally in the dead of night, to ram through a bill that strips citizens of their charter rights, an issue that the Premier didn't mention once during the election campaign.

Is that what "functional" looks like to this Premier?

Hon. Doug Ford: Through you, Mr. Speaker: I want to thank everyone for staying here last night. I want to thank the NDP, the Liberals, the Green and especially our party.

Leader of the Opposition, you're accusing me of doing things, but you weren't even here last night. While you were sleeping, your team was fighting—

Interjections.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): The Premier will take his seat.

It's not helpful or appropriate to make reference to the absence of any members.

The Premier.

Hon. Doug Ford: Withdraw.

We were here last night, like tens of thousands, if not hundreds of thousands, of people around this province—the police officers who have to work at night, the nurses who have to work at night and factory workers who have to work at night. I don't know what we were making such a big deal about because we actually had to work at night, no different than anyone else.

We were fighting for the taxpayers of this great city. As we were working, tens of thousands of people across this city—

Interjections.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Stop the clock. Time's up. Start the clock.

Hon. Doug Ford: Mr. Speaker—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): No. Time's up. Supplementary?

Ms. Andrea Horwath: This Premier never disappoints with his pettiness.

The people who filled the gallery last night are concerned citizens. The Premier may want to ignore them, but unlike the professional actors that he hired to cheer for him during the campaign, these folks are not going away, and they're not alone.

Last week in question period the Premier said that former Prime Minister Jean Chrétien agreed with his plan to override charter rights. Has the Premier been updated lately on what the former Prime Minister actually thinks?

Hon. Doug Ford: Through you, Mr. Speaker: As I've said over and over again, we're here to get this city moving. We're here to build transit, to get people from home to work—believe it or not—sooner than three hours. It takes people sometimes three and four hours to get back and forth to work because we don't have any transit. The infrastructure is just crumbling underneath our feet, and we all know about the housing crisis. We have a major housing crisis. We're going to make sure that we fix transit, that we fix the housing crisis, and we start getting infrastructure going.

My friends, if we have to work every single night for the next four years, that's exactly what we'll do to turn this province around.

Interjections.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Stop the clock. Start the clock.

Final supplementary?

Ms. Andrea Horwath: Back to the actual question I was asking: It seems like the Premier got a bad briefing last week, because this is what Prime Minister Chrétien and others wrote this week: "We condemn" Premier Ford's "actions and call on those in his cabinet and caucus to stand up to him."

The statement wasn't just signed by Prime Minister Chrétien. It was also signed by Roy McMurtry, the Progressive Conservative Attorney General who helped frame the charter. He's joining other prominent Progressive Conservatives wondering what has happened to their party, and thousands of Ontarians who think the charter is more important than the Premier's fixation on the city of Toronto.

Does the Premier think that every one of these people is simply wrong, and that he and he alone is right?

Hon. Doug Ford: Through you, Mr. Speaker: It's very clear in the Constitution that we were able to use it, we have the right to use it, and we will use it.

My friends, I can tell you this is about protecting the people of Toronto: It's not about protecting the downtown NDP. I have never seen a group of people waste so much energy on protecting politicians' jobs than each and every one of you. I just wish once, Mr. Speaker, the Leader of the Opposition would come in with some cost savings, with some ideas to save the taxpayers money. God forbid the Leader of the Opposition actually won. There would be 4,500 people out of work right now in Pickering. They'd be looking for jobs. We'd be paying close to \$2 a litre for gasoline—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you. Next question?

GOVERNMENT'S AGENDA

Ms. Andrea Horwath: The next question is also for the Premier, the Premier who lost 81,000 jobs in August in Ontario.

Ontario families have a lot of urgent business for the government. They're sending their kids to schools that have lead in the drinking water; they're crammed in hospital hallways waiting for treatment; and, as I said, 80,000 of them lost a job last month. They're looking to Queen's Park for action. Instead, they see a Premier who has dropped everything to focus on the size of Toronto city council, even though senior figures in his own party tell him he's wrong; even though he has to barricade himself inside this Legislature in the dead of night; even though it means overriding the Charter of Rights and Freedoms.

What does this Premier say to families who have different priorities?

Hon. Doug Ford: Through you, Mr. Speaker: That's pretty rich. That is pretty rich coming from the Leader of the Opposition, this same Leader of the Opposition who propped up the Liberals 97% of the time—propped them up on all the scandals; propped them up on raising the hydro rates; propped them up on raising taxes. You were side by side, shoulder to shoulder with the most politically corrupt government in the history of Ontario.

1040

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Supplementary?

Ms. Andrea Horwath: The people of this province need good jobs. Instead, they get the Premier's grudges with Toronto city councillors. The people of this province need good schools where their children can drink the water. Instead, they have a provincial government obsessing about one municipal election. The people of this province need shorter wait times in hospitals. Instead, they get a government that's taking away their rights—literally in the middle of the night. The people of this province need a government that makes their family a priority. Instead, they have a Premier who makes himself a priority. When is this Premier going to get his priorities straight?

Hon. Doug Ford: Through you, Mr. Speaker: We're making sure we're getting the priorities right. This government here, the PC government—no one in the country has ever moved quicker for the taxpayers than this government right here. The Leader of the Opposition could look at our top 20—our top 20 where we're already saving hundreds of millions of dollars for the taxpayers, no matter whether it's getting rid of the wind turbines—over 700 turbines are gone, over \$700 million is saved back into the taxpayers' pocket. No matter if it's challenging the federal government on the carbon tax, the worst tax anyone could ever see. My friends, we're going to continue working hard for the taxpayers. We're going to work hard for the people of Toronto, the economic engine of Ontario. We will create jobs. We won't be losing 300,000 jobs, like the previous—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you. Final supplementary.

Ms. Andrea Horwath: You know, Speaker, usually it takes years for governments to lose touch and wear out their welcome with the people who elected them. I can remember the backbench government members who were here a few short months ago on that side, who ignored their constituents and followed a Premier who had lost touch with people's priorities.

The Premier bragged last night that skeptics doubted that he could pass this bill. No one ever said the Premier couldn't get this bill passed. Thousands and thousands of Ontarians think he shouldn't get this bill passed. They want a government that's fixing schools, cutting wait times and creating jobs, not a Premier locked in the Legislature in the middle of the night railing against old enemies at his old job. Does this Premier understand the difference, Speaker?

Hon. Doug Ford: Through you, Mr. Speaker: Again, the Leader of the Opposition was pretending she was here.

It must have been in her dreams. Because when I was speaking, the leader—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Once again, it's inappropriate and unhelpful to make reference to the—at any given time a member might be absent. Any of us might be absent for a good reason, so that's why we don't do it.

Premier, response.

Hon. Doug Ford: Mr. Speaker, through you: Again, this government in here is to make changes. As I said last night, it's about empowering the people instead of the government. It's about putting money back into the people's pocket instead of the government's pocket. It's about reducing the size and cost of government. People are just tapped out in this province. They can't afford any more taxes. We have to make sure that every single area that the previous government implemented to raise the taxes, no matter if it's your licence fee—even \$7, as the finance minister said last night—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you. Next question.

GOVERNMENT'S AGENDA

Ms. Andrea Horwath: My next question is to the Deputy Premier, coincidentally the person who had the most votes during the Conservative leadership and the most riding support. The Premier has indicated that he "would not be shy" about overriding the charter again in order to get what he wants. The Deputy Premier stated last week that she was confident that any future attack on charter rights would be discussed at the cabinet table. Can the Deputy Premier give us some sense of what her "no go" areas will be when it comes to overriding charter rights again?

Hon. Christine Elliott: Minister of Municipal Affairs.

Hon. Steve Clark: Speaker, through you, thank you to the member for the question. This was a historic morning.

Interjection.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): The member for Hamilton West—Ancaster—Dundas will withdraw.

Ms. Sandy Shaw: I will withdraw.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Again, I remind the members that ministers have the right to refer a question if they choose to do so.

The Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing can reply.

Hon. Steve Clark: Thank you, Speaker.

The reason we recalled the Legislature on Saturday, the reason we were here this morning and have already had six and a half hours of debate on Bill 31, is because time is of the essence. We have an election on October 22. In order to preserve that election, in order to ensure that that streamlined Toronto council is available to make those important decisions upon their election—that's why we're here.

We need to have Bill 31, the Efficient Local Government Act, passed. If the opposition really, truly wants to build transit, if they really, truly want to build infrastructure, then they should be supporting our bill, because that's

exactly what we're trying to do. We're trying to have that streamlined council.

I again ask the opposition to support—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you.

Supplementary?

Ms. Andrea Horwath: Back to the Deputy Premier: People are justifiably confused as to where the Deputy Premier stands on all of this. She hinted that she might be willing to stand up to the Premier the next time he tries to trample Ontarians' charter rights, but this time she's effectively silent—even as Progressive Conservative giants like Bill Davis, Brian Mulroney, Roy McMurtry and Peter MacKay step forward to say that the Premier is wrong. McMurtry every urged the cabinet and caucus to stand up to Premier Ford: "History will judge them by their silence."

If the Deputy Premier won't stand up for the charter now, why should anybody believe that she will any time in the future?

Hon. Steve Clark: Well, I'll tell you something: The Premier wasn't silent during the election. Every day during the election, he talked about reducing the size and cost of government. He talked about respecting the taxpayer's dollar.

Interjections.

Hon. Steve Clark: They will howl all they want, Speaker, but the people sent us here to get things done, and that's exactly what we're doing with Bill 31. That's exactly what we were doing this morning from midnight till 6:30 in the morning. We want to get this bill passed so that Toronto council can make those important decisions, so they can have that streamlined council.

They can howl all they want; we're here to work.

TAXATION

Mr. Bill Walker: Speaker, through you, my question is for the Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks.

In the past couple of months, we've seen many flip-flops with the federal government and their climate change plan. We've seen them climb down over their carbon pricing guidelines, and just three weeks ago, NDP Premier Rachel Notley pulled Alberta out of the federal climate plan, citing the federal government's inability to get their natural resources to market. She expressed feelings of anger and disappointment with the federal government having let them down.

Last Friday, our minister provided an update to the people of Ontario with a very important step forward taken by our government against the federal government's attempt to impose a carbon tax on the people of Ontario.

Through you, Speaker: Can the Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks explain to the House what progress has been made?

Hon. Rod Phillips: Through you, Mr. Speaker, thank you to the member from Bruce-Grey for his hard work on behalf of his constituents and all of us last night. It was well noted.

During the election, our plan was clear. A cornerstone of that plan was to make sure that we repeal the job-killing, regressive cap-and-trade program of the previous government and that, if necessary, we would fight the imposition of the Liberal carbon tax on the people of Ontario all the way to the Supreme Court.

Last week, our government issued what's called a statement of particulars with the Ontario Court of Appeal. It lays out the next steps in that fight to ensure that Ontario families are not punished by the Liberal tax. This statement outlines the reasons why our position on the carbon tax is that it is unconstitutional.

Our government will put the people first and stand against any carbon tax from the federal Liberals.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Supplementary question.

Mr. Bill Walker: I'd like to thank the minister for his answer. Back to the Minister of the Environment: It's clear that this government has the best interests of Ontario families at heart. It is also clear that this government has done more and kept more promises in the first four months than the previous government did in the last four years. This is a government that keeps the promises it makes to the people of Ontario.

Speaker, the language from the federal government is concerning. They have made clear that they believe the only solution to climate change is a tax—sounds a bit like the NDP. We have been equally clear that we reject that notion.

As Bill 4 would rid the province of the Liberals' cap-and-trade scheme, we will need a plan to address the challenges that climate change presents to our future generations. Can the minister advise this House as to what the government's plans are to address climate change in Ontario?

Hon. Rod Phillips: Mr. Speaker, through you to the member: Ontario has made significant progress in climate change. Total greenhouse gas emissions have been reduced by 22% since 2005. This achievement has come at a cost to Ontarians. Ontarians have done a great deal, but Ontario can and will do more.

1050

Mr. Speaker, we recognize the challenge that climate change faces, and we will do our part. That's why we consulted with the people of Ontario through the campaign. Our first step was Bill 4, to withdraw the failed cap-and-trade program of the previous government.

We're now working on a made-in-Ontario plan—a plan that will balance taxpayers' interests with the interests of the environment and prepare Ontario for the climate change that is happening. Our Ontario-made plan will build on the results we've achieved, balance the economy and the environment, and not penalize Ontario families.

GOVERNMENT ACCOUNTABILITY

Ms. Sara Singh: My question is for the Attorney General.

By convention, the “notwithstanding” clause is reserved for extraordinary circumstances only. Employing it to meddle in Toronto's municipal elections is a frivolous use of a tool that is meant to be used with great caution. Many are concerned that the use of this controversial loophole is a troubling sign of what's to come.

Using the “notwithstanding” clause in this instance sets a frighteningly low bar for violating our constitutional rights in the future. If the government is willing to use it to attack Toronto now, where will the Attorney General draw the line?

Hon. Caroline Mulroney: There is wide consensus that section 33, as conceived by those who wrote and approved it, said that it was to be a tool that balanced the role of the courts and the role of the Legislature.

Allan Blakeney, the former NDP Premier of Saskatchewan, at the First Ministers' conference on the Constitution of November 1981, said that section 33 is “fully consistent with the sort of argument we have put forward that we need to balance the protection of rights with the existence of our institutions which have served us so well for so many centuries.”

Mr. Speaker, we've been clear that we are invoking section 33 of the Charter of Rights and Freedoms because time is of the essence. The election is on October 22, and the voters of Toronto need certainty. That is why we have taken the action that we have.

Interjections.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Stop the clock. Members will take their seats. Start the clock.

Supplementary question?

Ms. Sara Singh: While I can appreciate the comments made by the Attorney General, this weekend 400 legal professionals in Ontario signed an open letter to our Attorney General urging her to vote against the use of the “notwithstanding” clause.

The letter says: “The government is beholden to the highest law in the land, which is the Constitution. We expect the Attorney General of Ontario to value the role of the judiciary and the important check that the courts have on the impulses of the government.”

Does the Attorney General believe that the judiciary has a responsibility to act as a check on our government?

Hon. Caroline Mulroney: I thank the honourable member for her question.

She references the highest law of our land. Section 33 of the charter, which is part of the highest law of our land, confirms the paramountcy of Legislatures to decide matters within their area of jurisdiction. It is a tool that recognizes the long-standing principle that Canada is a parliamentary democracy. The purpose of section 33 is to provide a mechanism so that where there's a disagreement between a judge and a Legislature surrounding the constitutionality of a law, the people get the final say.

As with all exercises of parliamentary power, the ramifications of our decisions will occur at the ballot box.

TOURISM

Mr. Michael Parsa: My question is for the Minister of Tourism, Culture and Sport.

The summer season is winding down for tourism operators across the province.

In my riding of Aurora–Oak Ridges–Richmond Hill, in the towns of Aurora and Richmond Hill, people come from near and far to enjoy attractions such as the great moraine, Lake Wilcox and the David Dunlap Observatory, among other great attractions.

Can the minister tell us about how tourism is important to Ontario's economy and to creating good jobs right here in Ontario?

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Minister of Tourism, Culture and Sport.

Hon. Sylvia Jones: Good to see you again, Speaker.

The member from Aurora–Oak Ridges–Richmond Hill is absolutely right: Tourism is an important part of Ontario's economy. In fact, the tourism sector generates over 390,000 jobs and generates \$34.1 billion in economic activity. Our ministry will work with the tourism industry to maximize growth and investment and send a message that Ontario is open for business. Our government is committed to diversifying and strengthening tourism, from the north to the south, to the east to the west. As the honourable member knows, we have ambitious plans for Ontario's economy, and I'd love to expand on that in your supplementary.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Supplementary?

Mr. Michael Parsa: I thank the minister for that very insightful answer. It reminds me of how vital tourism is to our province. I'm glad to see the mantra of being open for business extends to our tourism partners as well.

Can the minister elaborate on how our government for the people supports tourism operators, along with all the great festivals and events that bring people from all over the world to our great province of Ontario?

Hon. Sylvia Jones: I'm happy to—and thank you for the question.

Under our government, the tourism industry will grow. We're going to rely on experts—tourism operators—to help us do that. Government can't create jobs on our own, but we can create conditions that make it easier to start a business, grow a business or invest in Ontario. That's why we will continue to lower hydro rates and business taxes, and it's why we will cut red tape for businesses.

We also provide support for festivals and events through programs like Celebrate Ontario or the Ontario Trillium grants. Our ministry and tourism partners across Ontario share a collaborative approach that maximizes resources and encourages strategic planning and investment to further grow tourism and jobs across Ontario. Economic modelling proves that every dollar of provincial investment results in almost \$21 of visitor spending. We are going to ensure value for money in our tourism investments and ensure that Ontario is open for business.

MUNICIPAL ELECTIONS

Ms. Jessica Bell: My question is for the Premier. Can the Premier explain the consultation process for Bill 5?

Hon. Doug Ford: Through you, Mr. Speaker, we had the longest consultation ever when we criss-crossed the province and we talked to people about reducing the size of government. I came to Toronto and talked to the people, from Etobicoke to Scarborough, in North York, East York and downtown. I heard the same sentiment, and the sentiment was that this government is dysfunctional at city hall; it gets nothing done. We couldn't build transit in the last 20 years, we have a housing crisis, we have a crumbling infrastructure—that's what I heard when I talked to the people of Toronto. They're fed up. They're fed up with the dysfunction at city hall. They want less politicians.

As a matter of fact, Mr. Speaker, I never heard one person come up to me and say, "Doug, we need more politicians. We want a larger bureaucracy." But I can tell you one thing: There was no consultation when they went—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you. Supplementary?

Ms. Jessica Bell: Back to the Premier: New Democrats just received a freedom-of-information request from the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing. We asked the ministry for records on the consultations for Bill 5, as well as the instructions that were given to the ministry for drafting the bill. The ministry responded with, "After conducting a thorough search through the ministry files, no records were located responsive to your request."

Speaker, can the Premier tell the House who he cut a backroom deal with to rip up Toronto's wards in the middle of an election?

Hon. Doug Ford: Through you, Mr. Speaker, the people of Toronto do not want to see another four years of dysfunction, four years of not building transit, four years of raising taxes. That's what people are fed up with. People want to see transit built, infrastructure built and housing built. I can tell you, it doesn't take 47 people to do that. It takes 25 councillors to do that.

1100

Do you know who is going to be happier than anyone, Mr. Speaker? The mayor. The mayor is going to be happier than anyone because he's not going to have to work 47 people. They're going to get things done. As I've said over and over again, good governance is seven to nine people on a board. People want less politicians; they don't want more politicians. In the next election, I'd be more than happy to run on less politicians and—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you.

Interjections.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Stop the clock. Order.

Start the clock. Next question.

GOVERNMENT ACCOUNTABILITY

Mr. Mike Schreiner: My question is for the Premier. Early this morning, during debate on Bill 31, the Premier said that he wanted to reduce the power of government,

but Bill 31 does exactly the opposite. It places an unprecedented amount of power in the government's hands. Invoking the "notwithstanding" clause is the government using big power to suspend people's charter rights.

How can the Premier say he is reducing power when he's using the heavy hand of government power to suspend people's charter rights?

Hon. Doug Ford: Through you, Mr. Speaker: There won't be any rights taken away. It's going to be very clear. Every person in Toronto will be able to elect their elected councillor. Every single person in Toronto should be able to pick up the phone when they have an issue and call their councillor, and every councillor should go to their door and answer their request.

My friends, I did it for four years and I took care of more than one ward. I took care of a dozen wards. Do you know why I took care of a dozen wards? Because the existing councillors were ignoring the phone calls. They weren't calling people back.

Through you, Mr. Speaker, I still take municipal calls every single day on transit, on housing, on infrastructure, because the average constituent needs help—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you. Supplementary?

Mr. Mike Schreiner: Mr. Speaker, through you back to the Premier: The very definition of invoking the "notwithstanding" clause is suspending people's charter rights. That is a huge, big power grab. That's exactly why people like former Prime Minister Brian Mulroney said, "I don't like the 'notwithstanding' clause." It's exactly why former Progressive Conservative Premier Bill Davis has condemned the Premier's use of the "notwithstanding" clause. Using big government power to change the rules in the middle of an election campaign has never happened in Canadian history.

The legal costs are mounting. How many taxpayer dollars is the Premier prepared to waste on his scheme to interfere in local Toronto elections?

Hon. Doug Ford: Through you, Mr. Speaker, and to my friend the member from Guelph: We should start focusing on jobs. I'll have to tell you a quick story. We had a company come to us, a company from China, that wants to employ 400 people, a window manufacturer. And guess what, Mr. Speaker? They wanted to go to Guelph, but Guelph refused them. Who refuses 400 jobs? I don't understand it, but I'm sure there are jurisdictions all around Ontario that would love a glass company to come to their riding. Come to Etobicoke, come to Scarborough, come to any of our MPPs' areas. They'll be happy to take 400 jobs.

The member from Guelph didn't want the 400 jobs over there. He'd rather come down here and argue.

MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT

Mrs. Robin Martin: My question is to the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing. Over the weekend, our government was hard at work for the people, moving forward with the Efficient Local Government Act.

The NDP loves big government and is using every delay tactic that they can to save politicians' jobs. But we know Toronto needs an efficient and effective council that can make important decisions faster.

In leading off the debate, Minister, you mentioned the number of former Premiers who support us using the legal tools in the Constitution like Bill 31 has, and we want to make sure that it is passed in time for the upcoming municipal election. Can you tell us more about the Premiers' support?

Hon. Steve Clark: I want to thank the member for Eglinton–Lawrence for that question. You are absolutely right. Three former Premiers, Christy Clark from British Columbia, Brad Wall from Saskatchewan, and Jean Charest from Quebec, have all come out supporting us on the use of section 33 of the charter. They were on a CBC panel show last week talking about it.

Former Premier Clark stated, "I actually think it's a good thing for Canada because we are in a moment when Canadians are looking around and saying, 'Hey, why can't anything get done?' ... Well, Premier Ford has shown there is a way to find a way to get things done...." Speaker, Christy Clark is right. That's exactly what our government is doing.

We're here today—we were here at midnight—to get things done. That's something that, actually, the city council in Toronto can do once Bill 31 is passed. That's why we're here, and I appreciate—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you. Supplementary?

Mrs. Robin Martin: Thank you for that answer, Minister. It's important for the people of Ontario to know that those former Premiers, who have had to make tough decisions themselves, support what we're doing.

The angry NDP and their leader can continue to shout and personally insult our members, as they do every day, but that is not going to keep us from doing the jobs that we were elected to do.

We talked every day during the campaign about reducing the size and cost of government, and 2.3 million Ontarians gave us a mandate to do that.

Can the minister explain why the Efficient Local Government Act is a priority?

Hon. Steve Clark: Speaker, through you to the member: Bill 31 is important for Torontonians because it's time to end the political gridlock and dysfunction at city hall, but it's bigger than that.

When decisions are delayed by endless debate, transit and infrastructure projects aren't being built. People and goods can't get to where they need to because the gridlock at city hall creates gridlock on our roads. That hurts Ontario's economy, which makes it everyone's concern.

The opposition claims housing and transit are priorities for them. If that's true, they would support our legislation, because we won't see shovels in the ground without a streamlined, effective council that will make those projects happen.

Thank you for the question.

MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT

Mr. Jeff Burch: My question is to the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing. Ever since the Premier decided to disrupt local democracy in Toronto, other municipalities have wondered if they're next, but the government can't keep its story straight.

At AMO last month, the Premier said he was only interested in Toronto, but last week, he said he was getting "endless calls" to cut Ottawa's council. The member for Nepean said the Premier didn't mean it. But then the member for Niagara West told the St. Catharines Standard that the Premier may now be targeting Niagara region and other regional councils.

Speaker, to the minister: Who should we believe?

Hon. Steve Clark: Speaker, through you to the member: I want to thank you for actually being able to place a question on the floor today without having to withdraw a derogatory comment like every other question you've given me.

Our government was very clear; at AMO, our Premier made his comments very known. I made my comments very known. Our government, at that conference, set a record with 548 consultation meetings with municipalities. Our government made it very clear and told municipalities directly we want to hear from them about how we can make government work more effectively and more efficiently.

1110

We were very, very clear in our conversation with them. We wanted to make sure that they felt free to give us ideas about, in terms of regional government, what worked and what didn't work. We're going to continue to have that dialogue. It was a great start at that AMO conference. But, again, I'm just a little concerned with this member and how—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you. Supplementary.

Mr. Jeff Burch: The Premier didn't run on cutting Toronto city council—everyone knows it. During the election, there was not a single word from any member of the government on their plans to meddle in local democracy. Now we're getting conflicting information as to whether or not more municipalities will be subject to attacks like Toronto.

Will the minister be honest with the people of Ontario and tell the House if the government will be cutting the size of city council for other municipalities or regional governments: yes or no?

Hon. Steve Clark: Speaker, through you to the member: Read Bill 31. It deals with Toronto city council. Read the Premier's speech at AMO. He was very clear about why and what this bill is about, and what the previous Bill 5 was about.

Yes, we asked municipalities if they have ideas on how they can run better, and we received lots of ideas. We received ideas on how we can reduce their regulatory burden. We had ideas on how we can speed up the development process, so that we can actually get some

affordable housing to market faster. We engaged our municipal partners.

I want to take this opportunity to thank my two parliamentary assistants, Jim McDonell and Christine Hogarth, for the amount of meetings that they had at AMO.

This government wants to hear from Ontario's 444 municipalities on how we can deliver those critical services better to our taxpayers. The member should read some of those speeches—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you. Next question.

GOVERNMENT SPENDING

Ms. Natalia Kusendova: I was so proud to be here this morning with my colleagues to work hard to bring Ontario back on track. Earlier this morning, the Honourable Minister of Finance delivered a rousing speech in which he encouraged all members to fill out the Planning for Prosperity online consultation survey. The Minister of Finance said, "Bring the ideas to help return prosperity to Ontario. Don't fight these ideas; join us."

It is the responsibility of all of us in this House to be stewards of public finances and to ensure that we leave a stable foundation for future generations to build upon, and not a legacy of debt, like that of the former government.

Can the President of the Treasury Board please inform the House what the government is doing to ensure that Ontario continues to be prosperous now and into the future?

Hon. Peter Bethlenfalvy: Thank you to the member from Mississauga Centre for that very excellent question. I, too, appreciated the comments this morning about our Planning for Prosperity consultations. Friday is the last day for submissions, so I encourage everyone, regardless of party affiliation, to submit their comments. Working closely with my friend the Minister of Finance and with the full support of the Premier, I can assure this House that we are taking our responsibility for putting Ontario back on track seriously.

Every action we take, every bill we make, has as a goal the difficult task of getting our province back on track and repairing 15 years of financial neglect.

As for the Planning for Prosperity consultations, together we can work towards a stronger, more prosperous Ontario.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Supplementary.

Ms. Natalia Kusendova: Back to the President of the Treasury Board: The former government sold Ontario up the creek without a paddle. Through poor fiscal and program management, they let the people of Ontario down. The NDP, instead of opposing this recklessness, voted with the government 97% of the time. The NDP enabled the recklessness of the previous government. As a result, Ontario spends more on interest payments on the provincial debt than it does on the entire Ontario public service, or on all of post-secondary education and training. Quite simply, we are robbing future generations on interest

payments alone and saddling them with a devastating burden of debt.

Can the President of the Treasury Board please advise this House what the government is doing to get public spending back under control?

Hon. Peter Bethlenfalvy: Thank you for another well-informed question. Aside from the financial inquiry, line-by-line audit of the public books and discretionary-spending freeze, we also wanted to consult the people. That's why we launched the Planning for Prosperity consultation, which closes this Friday. I'm pleased to inform the House that the people continue to submit ideas, with almost 15,000 individual ideas submitted so far—some, I suspect, from the other side of the House.

The people of Ontario have called for a government that listens, and we have answered that call. To all those people out there struggling to make ends meet, to all the business owners who are suffering, to all the families that have expenses ever-climbing, I say this: We are listening, and help is on the way.

ANTI-RACISM ACTIVITIES

Ms. Laura Mae Lindo: My question is to the Minister of Community Safety and Correctional Services. Does the minister believe racism exists in Ontario, and, if so, does the minister believe addressing racism in all of its forms is a lower priority than forcing through Bill 31?

Hon. Michael A. Tibollo: Thank you for that question. First of all, we've made it very clear that there is no place in the province of Ontario for racism. We consider ourselves to be an inclusive province and we respect everyone.

I want to assure the House as well that the Anti-Racism Directorate is continuing to fulfill its mandate of a whole-of-government approach to address systemic racism by implementing a strategic plan. We will continue to work, as a ministry and through the directorate, to ensure that racism is not something that continues in the province or is in the province of Ontario.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Supplementary.

Ms. Laura Mae Lindo: Thank you to the minister—I'm just a little concerned about the actual actions. One of the very first things this Conservative government did was quietly collapse the Anti-Racism Directorate, downgrade its minister to a part-time minister and disband its subcommittees.

The Anti-Racism Directorate played a crucial role in fighting back against racism in Ontario and, unfortunately, it seems that this is not a priority for the minister. In fact, it is so low on the list that we're using our time and resources to debate a bill that violates Ontarians' rights and freedoms, rather than tackling urgent life-and-death issues like racism.

Again, why is forcing through the Premier's charter-bashing Bill 31 more of an urgent priority for the minister than taking action against racism in Ontario?

Hon. Michael A. Tibollo: Through you, Mr. Speaker, thank you for that question. I assure you, from the day I

took over this portfolio and started working, I have been working diligently in every aspect of the portfolio from policing to corrections to the Anti-Racism Directorate. I will continue to work and to bring forward the issues that relate to this portfolio.

We are working on a whole-of-government approach, as I mentioned. We are implementing an anti-racism data standard, and we are collecting and analyzing reliable and usable data that will help the government identify any systemic barriers across sectors and help make evidence-based decisions to shape policies, programs and services, ultimately improving how the people of Ontario are served.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

Mr. Ross Romano: My question is for the Minister of Economic Development, Job Creation and Trade. Our government for the people was elected on the promise of making Ontario open for business to create and protect jobs, and we are committed to sending that message to the world.

The private sector has made it clear that, after a decade of failed liberal policies, it has become too difficult to open and operate a business in Ontario. Could the minister please inform the Legislature of his recent efforts to consult with Ontario businesses on reducing red tape?

Hon. Jim Wilson: I thank my honourable colleague for the question. I just want to report to the House that last week my parliamentary assistant, Michael Parsa, and I co-hosted red tape reduction round tables in Barrie, Simcoe, Toronto and Newmarket. PA Parsa also went on to chair round tables in Peterborough, Richmond Hill, Durham and Ottawa—a very busy and excellent parliamentary assistant.

1120

These round tables mark the beginning of our province-wide consultations to hear from business owners, the ones on the front lines who feel the impact of excessive regulations, red tape and the Liberal mismanagement of the past. Throughout the campaign and in our consultations, we've heard that there is a lot that can be done to streamline regulations without compromising health or safety. For example, we heard from one business owner who has moved his manufacturing business from Ontario to the US, saying, "It was like going from a torture chamber to a candy store." That's—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you.

Interjections.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Stop the clock.

Restart the clock. Supplementary question.

Mr. Ross Romano: Thank you to the minister for his response. It is reassuring to hear that our government for the people is committed wholeheartedly to ensuring that Ontario is open for business again.

Too many Ontario employers have left, or are threatening to leave our province, because of the policies of the previous Liberal government. This was a government that

imposed unnecessary costs on businesses and stifled growth.

Business resources should be spent on improving and innovating, not on clearing regulatory hurdles. Could the minister please further explain the necessity to act boldly to ensure that Ontario is once again the economic engine of Canada?

Hon. Jim Wilson: Thank you again to my colleague for the question. Certainly the time for correcting Ontario's economic direction is now. The number of regulations in Ontario has grown to over 380,000, regulatory burdens unheard of anywhere else in the western world—380,000. British Columbia, by comparison, has just over 200,000, and no one thinks BC is a terrible place to live, work and raise their family.

We want to be the leader in Canada once again and the leader in the world. We want to take the guesswork and the grey areas for our businesses away by simplifying the regulatory process. We will cut taxes, as the Premier says, reduce red tape, and let the world know that Ontario is open for business. We can do it, we will do it, and I encourage all members to get out there, hold your own red tape round tables, and you'll see how bad it is and what a—

Interjections.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Stop the clock. Members will take their seats. Order.

Restart the clock. Next question.

EMPLOYMENT STANDARDS

Mr. Jamie West: My question is to the Minister of Labour. Last week, the minister penned an op-ed boasting of their government's plan to freeze the minimum wage at \$14 an hour and remove \$2,000 a year out of the hands of the lowest-wage workers in the province.

Does the minister believe that violating the rights and freedoms of Ontarians by forcing through Bill 31 is more important than listening to Ontario's workers and securing a fairer living wage and better working conditions?

Hon. Laurie Scott: I thank the member opposite for the question. Yes, our government made a commitment to keep the minimum wage at \$14 an hour. I and my caucus members believe in good-paying jobs and opportunity for all Ontarians, so raising the minimum wage did not do what it was supposed to do.

On January 1, 2018, Ontario's general minimum wage for most workers jumped from \$11.60 to \$14 an hour. The sudden 20% increase in the minimum wage hasn't helped our economy, and an additional increase to \$15 will not help it either.

Since the rise in the minimum wage last year, Ontario has lost tens of thousands of jobs. In August, Ontario lost over 80,000, our largest monthly job loss in a decade. Every one of those jobs was part-time.

We need to give employers time to adjust to the new minimum wage, which is why we promised to keep the minimum wage at \$14 an hour.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Supplementary?

Mr. Jamie West: Back to the minister: We could be here to take action on increasing the minimum wage or creating better working conditions for Ontario's workers. Instead, we're here once again using our time and resources to debate a bill that violates Ontarians' rights and freedoms.

Why is focusing on Toronto city council a more urgent priority for the minister than taking action on labour issues for workers across the province?

Hon. Laurie Scott: Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing.

Hon. Steve Clark: I thank the minister and I want to thank the member for the question.

Again, why did we recall the Legislature on Saturday? Why did we meet from midnight to 7 a.m. this morning? Because we are committed to having an efficient and effective council at Toronto city hall. We want those priorities.

Listen, during that election we talked to people every day about reducing the size and cost of government. Ontarians let us know that they wanted a government that gets things done. That's what we're doing here. There are very important priorities. Perhaps the NDP don't share the same priorities that we have. I believe that, by having a streamlined council here, that would be better for decision-making. We believe that having a government that respects taxpayers' dollars is a good thing. That's why Ontarians sent us and that's why we're here on this side of the House.

Again, the NDP have a bit of a challenge when it comes to—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Next question.

DISCRIMINATION

Ms. Lindsey Park: My question is for the minister of status of women. We have a situation in September 2018 where members of the NDP and other members of civil society continue to ask questions like why our Attorney General is not taking her father's advice and why she's somehow silent and submissive in our PC caucus. In fact, we have a Toronto city councillor tweeting out, "Hey Brian, call your daughter."

Can the minister of status of women please tell us why this type of rhetoric is so unacceptable in 2018?

Hon. Lisa MacLeod: I'd like to thank the member from Durham for that very important question. As somebody who just this past year won the Equal Voice national award for advancing women in politics with our Prime Minister, Justin Trudeau, I have not been more disappointed in the discourse against my colleague, my seatmate, my friend, our Attorney General, in the last two weeks from the left-wing politicians in the city of Toronto and across the aisle.

On the weekend, I read an article where she was condemned effectively for not taking her husband's last name. Well, I haven't either, Speaker, and not once in 13 years has my last name become an article in the Toronto Star, but hers was. I thought that went the way of the dodo

bird after Maureen McTeer didn't take Joe Clark's last name.

But let me also be clear: Not one member of this assembly whose father was a previous politician, whether it's the member from Kitchener–Conestoga or the Premier—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you.

Interjections.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Stop the clock. Start the clock.

Supplementary question?

Ms. Lindsey Park: Mr. Speaker, through you, I thank the minister for her important answer.

We have an Attorney General who is a talented, well-educated lawyer, founder of her own charity, a role model to so many young women. We need to act in this place in a way that is respectful of women and their accomplishments. So many young women are looking to us as an example.

Can the minister tell us why we must condemn this divisive language and stand behind the strong women who are participating in our democracy on their merits?

Interjections.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Order. Government House leader, come to order.

Response, Minister.

Hon. Lisa MacLeod: Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity to respond to that very important question.

Many of us in this chamber have fought our entire careers to make sure women are equal in the workplace and women are part of our political discourse. What I have seen over the past two weeks in the left-wing media and by them—and, by the way, the protesters who have shown up to target my colleague rather than the Minister of Municipal Affairs—is shameful, it's disgraceful, and it should not be tolerated.

1130

In fact, this morning when I walked home to my apartment with my colleague the municipal affairs and housing minister, I actually asked him if he felt she was being targeted as well. He agreed, as does every member of this government.

We stand with our Attorney General. She's strong, she's competent, she's effective, and she's the best Attorney General we've ever had.

AFFORDABLE HOUSING

Ms. Suze Morrison: I'd like to direct my question to the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing.

Toronto is in the midst of a housing crisis which should, by all accounts, be at the top of this government's list of priorities. But, shamefully, the minister and this government do not agree.

We have never seen a housing crisis in Toronto the way that we have now. The wait-list for Toronto Community Housing is more than 10 years. In the case of my own family, my mom waited on that list for 15 years.

Why does this minister believe that forcing through legislation that violates my constituents' rights and freedoms is a higher priority than taking action on the absolutely deplorable housing crisis that we are facing in Toronto and all across Ontario?

Hon. Steve Clark: Speaker, through you, I want to thank the member for the question.

Housing is a very important issue in this city. I believe very strongly that one of the best ways we can help tackle that problem is to have a streamlined council that, on October 22, can help work with our government on making those important decisions.

I've said a lot of times in this House our feeling, that we need more supply, we need to get housing, the approvals process—we need to work with our municipal partners, our service managers, our Indigenous program administrators to see if we can get more supply faster into the market. That was one of my key messages at the Association of Municipalities of Ontario conference. I spoke to Mayor Tory about that very fact, I think, the very first day that I became minister. I'll continue to work with those municipalities and our program partners to get that done.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Supplementary?

Ms. Suze Morrison: Again, back to the minister: The government has not called us here to discuss a solution to the housing crisis. The government is not committing funding for social housing repairs or to build the 65,000 units of affordable housing that this province desperately needs. Instead, we are here to fight tooth and nail for the preservation of our Charter of Rights and Freedoms.

Speaker, this is unacceptable. I can't express how disappointed I am with this government and its inaction on housing as a whole.

Why is this minister ignoring Toronto's housing crisis in favour of trampling on the rights and freedoms of the residents of not only Toronto, but all of Ontario?

Hon. Steve Clark: Speaker, with the October 22 election fast approaching, we have to move quickly. That's why we recalled the Legislature. That's why we've debated Bill 31 for over six and a half hours this morning. We need to move this piece of legislation forward so that we can work with the new council, the streamlined council, on some of those important issues. I would hope that the member would understand how important it is to have that council in place. Time is of the essence. We need to move this bill forward through the legislative process.

Yes, we had a bill, Bill 5, that was passed. Unfortunately, that decision, which we're appealing, in which we hope to have a stay—is how we're dealing with the Bill 5 situation.

Again, we have a responsibility to the people of Toronto to have a council that's ready to make those important decisions on housing, transit and infrastructure. That's exactly what we were elected to do, and that's exactly what we're doing.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): There being no deferred votes, this House is in—

Interjection.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Just a second. I'm going to clarify something: The Speaker can't read anybody's mind, so if you have a point of order, I need you to stand up and audibly and loudly say, "Point of order," and then you call my attention to it.

I gather that the member has a point of order. I recognize the member for Guelph on a point of order.

Mr. Mike Schreiner: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I appreciate that.

I just want to be clear that the city of Guelph did not say no to the glass plant. It was Guelph/Eramosa township, which is in another riding that is held by—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you. It is not a point of order—perhaps a point of information.

Once again, this House is in recess until 1 p.m. this afternoon.

The House recessed from 1135 to 1300.

INTRODUCTION OF VISITORS

Ms. Jill Andrew: Good afternoon, Mr. Speaker. I would like to proudly welcome Omar Ha-Redeye, a lawyer. Thank you for joining us this afternoon, and thank you for fighting for our democracy.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): We welcome your guest to the Legislature, but again, I have to remind the member: no political statements in the introduction of guests.

Introduction of guests?

Ms. Doly Begum: I would like to introduce my good friend Aysha Sonna.

MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

GOVERNMENT'S AGENDA

Ms. Bhutla Karpoche: I rise today to bring the voices of the people of Parkdale–High Park, who overwhelmingly oppose Premier Ford's abuse of power and reject his attempt to bully our city and our province.

Premier Ford thinks he can do whatever he wants and places no value on the role of the judiciary in keeping the government in check. He has said repeatedly that he will not hesitate to use the "notwithstanding" clause again.

I ask the Attorney General, the Minister of Municipal Affairs and the rest of the Conservative cabinet and caucus, who are complicit in this unprecedented abuse of power: Do you know what rights can be suspended using this clause? Let me tell you: the right to freedom of conscience, of religion, of thought and expression; freedom of the press; freedom of peaceful assembly; the right to life, liberty and security of the person; the right to not be arbitrarily imprisoned; the right to counsel, to a fair trial and the presumption of innocence; and so on.

Take a moment to think about the consequences of your actions. We are debating a bill that suspends our rights and freedoms when there are more pressing issues we need to

deal with. We should be tackling the opioid crisis. We should be reversing the \$330-million cut to mental health. We should be working to fix our crumbling schools. We should be debating the issues that the people of Ontario expect us to debate. It's a shame Premier Ford has only done the opposite so far.

GOVERNMENT'S AGENDA

Ms. Teresa J. Armstrong: I rise today to talk about a very important and significant issue that is before the Legislature: Bill 31 and the "notwithstanding" clause. The Conservative government decided to use it as a sledgehammer to prioritize Premier Ford's agenda to meddle in the Toronto elections of October 22, 2018.

This government did not consult with the people of Toronto. The Conservative government thinks it does not need to go to the people they represent and to experts to get their input and opinions on what, if any, changes need to happen in the great city of Toronto.

The Conservative government called all members back to the Legislative Assembly on Sunday, at midnight, to debate Bill 31, because they believe that Justice Edward Belobaba erred when he ruled the Conservatives' Toronto elections bill violated the Charter of Rights. But what this Conservative government did not expect was that the people of Toronto were here in the Legislature and on the grounds making their voices heard, even though this Conservative government does not believe in public input on Bill 31.

The Premier and his MPPs have the gall to actually twist the intent of the "notwithstanding" clause to justify throwing the Toronto election into chaos so that Premier Ford could get his way. Well, let me tell you: The people have spoken. They rallied at midnight until 7 a.m., chanting, "We are the people. This is our House."

All Conservative members can pretend that they know best, but when it comes time for the next election, the public will remember what you did. You casually discarded all the rights of Ontarians by using the "notwithstanding" clause to force your will on the people. Your day of reckoning will come when the people of Ontario have a chance to have their voices heard in 2022.

GOVERNMENT'S AGENDA

Ms. Jennifer K. French: I was proud to stand in this Legislature last night with colleagues from both sides on behalf of the people of Ontario specifically to speak about Bill 31. I was in the House from midnight and didn't have the chance to debate it the way I wanted to and had the opportunity to sit in the chair for many hours. But I'd like to get some of the letters on the record.

Constituents from different ridings sent letters to me. I have one here from David Smith—not the member David Smith.

Interjection.

Ms. Jennifer K. French: No, he didn't send me a letter.

To the member from Durham:

“Ms. Park, I empathize with you that as a newly elected MPP this should be a very exciting time for you yet you have found yourself hitched to Doug Ford’s wagon which is focused on small-minded, self-serving and vindictive legislation that has very little to do with the people of Ontario and everything to do with” the Premier “‘sticking it to’ his former colleagues in Toronto....”

“I ask that you do right by the people of Durham and vote no to the trampling of our democratic rights and no to” this bill.

“As a community leader it is your turn to take a stand for democracy and to be on the right side of this sad chapter in Ontario’s history.”

I have a letter to Dave Smith, the member from Peterborough–Kawartha:

“I urge you to take action against your government and rescind your support of” this bill.

“With your experience in community hockey organizations, you of all people, should know that you can’t change the rules in the middle of a game....”

“Do the right thing.”

To the member from—I can’t believe I’m out of time. My goodness. If I had more time—I’m happy to share these with the members individually.

VETERANS’ HOUSE

Mrs. Marie-France Lalonde: It is a great pleasure to stand in this House and share a little bit of what’s going on in Orléans. I have the great privilege of serving and representing the riding of Orléans, and last Friday night we had a gala to raise money for Veterans’ House. This is the first home of its kind that would be built, and it’s an initiative with the Multifaith Housing Initiative.

A few years ago, they came to see the local federal member and myself and city council to look for a way of recognizing the hard work of our veterans, the fact that they go to war and sometimes when they come back life has a different path for them. One thing that we know is that, unfortunately, there are homeless. They served our country, they go and fight our fight, and they come here and we have to take care of them. So this great initiative was to raise money for this wonderful housing—40 units—that would actually help house veterans.

I look forward to this project moving forward. To be fair, Mr. Speaker, I may actually send a letter to the Minister of Infrastructure to see if this current government would like to support this wonderful initiative.

Hon. Steve Clark: I’m closer.

Mrs. Marie-France Lalonde: Actually, the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing is welcoming the initiative, so we will be talking. Thank you very much and thank you to all of our veterans, Mr. Speaker.

GOVERNMENT’S AGENDA

Mr. Kevin Yarde: As we all know, the court ruling came down stating that the Premier cannot cut the size of Toronto city council in half. Invoking section 33 is

messing with people’s rights. People are not okay with this, Mr. Speaker. People are appalled.

Even those who think the “notwithstanding” clause is a legitimate use of legislative prerogatives would say it should only be used in extreme or extraordinary circumstances, where there is a war going on or an insurrection. The last time I checked, I don’t believe there was a war going on anywhere in southern Ontario. I could be wrong—that is nothing new.

Now, there are circumstances, of course, when the jurisdiction of the jury—or in any case where, say, the courts run amok and, in terms of that happening, in enormous circumstances. But the courts have not run amok. This is nothing new that we see here.

Now, you can like or dislike the judge’s ruling, but we are talking about a fairly minor measure to change the size of council. And remember that the court didn’t say you can’t cut the size of council; they said that you can’t do it in the middle of an election or when an election is about to be called.

So, Mr. Speaker, there is no emergency, and there is no need for this bill.

1310

MOTIONS

HOUSE SITTINGS

Hon. Todd Smith: I move that when the House adjourns today it stand adjourned until Wednesday, September 19, at 9 a.m.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): The government House leader has moved that when the House adjourns today it will stand adjourned until Wednesday, September 19, at 9 a.m.

Debate?

Mr. Gilles Bisson: Mr. Speaker, I don’t plan on taking a lot of time. So my attempt here is not to slow things down for the government. I just want to put a couple of things on the record.

We’re adjourning the House in order to be able to get to the plowing match, and rightfully so. The plowing match is an important thing. At the same time, the government is saying there’s this big crisis, then they’re adjourning the House in order to go to the plowing match. I just find it a bit passing strange that the government has created a crisis, because this is a crisis that didn’t have to be created.

The government knew, under the Conservative government of Premier Ford, that there was going to be an election, and that particular election was set to happen in a certain way. I believe and New Democrats believe that it should never be the business—even though we have the power as an assembly to be able to tell them how large their council should be and what their wards should be and all that stuff, it’s not something that a Legislature normally does. Normally, we let the municipalities make those decisions, and for good reason.

I come from a municipality, Timmins. It was made up of Timmins; it was made up of Whitney, South Porcupine, Schumacher and Mountjoy. We decided, as a municipality, back in the 1970s—

Interjection.

Mr. Gilles Bisson: It's all part of the debate. I'm tying this in. I'm not going to be long.

We decided that we were going to amalgamate into one city. It wasn't the province that did it. We did it.

All I'm saying is, the government is creating a crisis here where a crisis didn't exist. At the same time, they're asking us to adjourn the House to be able to get to a plowing match, which is a good thing—we're not arguing. As New Democrats, we'll be there with you tomorrow. But I find it passing strange that on the one hand the government says we have this big, big crisis—we have to sit at midnight, we have to sit at 1 in the afternoon, we have to do all kinds of things—and then we're adjourning the House for the plowing match. I'm just saying the government is creating a crisis of its own here.

I look forward to the plowing match, Mr. Speaker. The plowing match is something that goes on every year. Members, with great pride, get to go to it. In fact, next year it's going to be in northern Ontario, up in, I believe, Sturgeon Falls.

M^{me} France Gélinas: Verner.

Mr. Gilles Bisson: It's going to be in Verner.

Again, we had it in northern Ontario about five, six, seven years ago, up in Earlton.

We look forward to all members being there and recognizing that there is a big part of Ontario, rural Ontario, that is important to all of us. Let's go to the plowing match and realize that there are other priorities we have to deal with in this province.

Interjection.

Mr. Gilles Bisson: I still have the floor. I'm talking about the plowing match, Mr. Speaker. I was almost—

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Are you almost done?

Interjection.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you.

The member for Scarborough–Guildwood.

Ms. Mitzie Hunter: Speaker, I rise to make a small insertion into this decision that we're about to make as a House.

As the member for Scarborough–Guildwood, I fully support the plowing matching, as well. Since I was elected in a by-election in 2013, I have attended the plowing match. This year, you don't have to have your rubber boots because it's a beautiful day.

However, we are in a situation where Toronto's elections are uncertain. We do need to recognize that the people of the city of Toronto, my constituents in Scarborough–Guildwood, need that certainty. So they will ask, "Why is the House not getting on with that business and taking the time to do the plowing match?"

I think all members are now agreeing and deciding that we are going to be stepping away from this House, this Legislature, to attend the plowing match, to honour that tradition. But the business of the city of Toronto's election

will still be in the balance. That's causing anxiety, it's causing uncertainty, and I do agree that this government has inserted itself in the middle of this election and created this situation that we are all experiencing and were debating here all night.

I just wanted to be on record as a member from Toronto that, while I support the participation in the plowing match—I will always do that—this uncertainty is causing grave concern for the people in Toronto, and it is as a result of the actions of this government.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Thank you very much.

Apparently, I interrupted the member for Timmins prematurely; I apologize for that. I thought you were done. I will recognize you again for a couple of minutes.

Mr. Gilles Bisson: I am not hurt in the least bit, Mr. Speaker. I was just about to finish.

I just wanted to wrap up on this particular point in regard to the plowing match. These are some very trying times for Canada and Ontario right now with what's happening with our trade negotiations in the United States. We're looking at the possible demise of the supply management system, which we all understand on all sides of the House is sacrosanct. We have one of the best systems when it comes to managing things like milk and chickens and others when it comes to supplying the market.

As we go to the plowing match, I think we have to remember that there are other issues that need to be dealt with in this province. If the government didn't create a crisis with the city of Toronto, we might have been able to deal with those things much more effectively.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): Once again, the government House leader has moved that when the House adjourns today, it will stand adjourned until Wednesday, September 19, at 9 a.m. Is it the pleasure of the House that the motion carry? Carried.

Motion agreed to.

PETITIONS

SOCIAL ASSISTANCE

Miss Monique Taylor: I have a petition named "Reverse Doug Ford's Cuts to Low-Income Families."

"To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

"Whereas Doug Ford eliminated the Basic Income Pilot project and slashed the new social assistance rates by 1.5%, and did so without warning;

"Whereas cuts to already-meagre social assistance rates will disproportionately impact children, those with mental health challenges, persons with disabilities, and people struggling in poverty;

"Whereas the decision to cancel the Basic Income Pilot project was made without any evidence, and leaves thousands of Ontarians without details about whether they will be able to access other forms of income assistance;

"Whereas the independently authored Income Security: A Roadmap for Change report, presented to the government last fall, recommends both increases to rates and the

continuation of the Basic Income Pilot project as key steps towards income adequacy and poverty reduction;

“Whereas the failure to address poverty—and the homelessness, hunger, health crises, and desperation that can result from poverty—hurts people, families and Ontario’s communities;

“Therefore we, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to immediately reverse Doug Ford’s callous decision to slash increases to social assistance rates by 50%, and reverse his decision to cancel the Basic Income Pilot project, decisions that will undoubtedly hurt thousands of vulnerable people and drag Ontario backwards when it comes to homelessness reduction and anti-poverty efforts.”

I fully agree with this. I will affix my name to it and give it to page Erin to bring to the Clerk.

SOCIAL ASSISTANCE

Ms. Mitzie Hunter: I have a petition here:

“Scrapping the Basic Income Pilot Project is Not Being ‘Compassionate’ nor ‘for the People.’

“To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

“Whereas the priorities of the Conservative government are dragging Ontario backwards leaving people with no basic income to those living on low income;

“Whereas the Conservative government is breaking their promises by scrapping a program they said they would keep;

“Whereas cancelling the Basic Income Pilot project will leave 4,000 people living in Thunder Bay, Lindsay, Hamilton, Brantford and Brant county with no basic income, further deteriorating their health, well-being and living conditions;

“Whereas reducing poverty in the province of Ontario does not work by decreasing the rates for Ontario’s most disadvantaged and marginalized people on Ontario Works and the Ontario Disability Support Program;

“Whereas Ontarians have a right to know about—and have a say in—government decisions that affect them;

“We, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to direct the Minister of Children, Community and Social Services to continue the Basic Income Pilot project, and to reinstate the regulatory changes that would allow people to keep more of their part-time earnings. If this government is truly for the people, then it should be for all people, including the poor.”

I will sign this petition and give it to our usher Hillary.

1320

MUNICIPAL ELECTIONS

Ms. Doly Begum: I’d like to thank Alan Sheppard and the rest of the constituents who have signed this petition, and welcome all my other residents in Scarborough Southwest to send in their petitions as well.

This is entitled “Stop Doug Ford from Interfering in Municipal Elections.”

“To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

“Whereas Doug Ford’s decision to reduce Toronto’s wards from 47 to 25 was made without any public consultation;

“Whereas Doug Ford’s meddling in municipal elections is an abuse of power;

“Whereas Doug Ford is cancelling democratic elections of some regional chairs;

“Therefore we, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to immediately reverse Doug Ford’s unilateral decision to dismantle Toronto city hall and cancel regional chair elections; to maintain the existing Toronto municipal boundaries; and ensure that the provincial government does not interfere with the upcoming Toronto municipal election for Ford’s political gain.”

I fully support this petition, and will be affixing my signature to it and giving it to page Erin.

MUNICIPAL ELECTIONS

Mr. Mike Schreiner: I have a petition to the Legislative Assembly of Ontario, from my constituents, on Bill 31.

“Whereas the Superior Court of Ontario has declared that Bill 5 violated the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms;

“Whereas an Ontario government has never before invoked the notwithstanding clause of the Canadian Constitution;

“Whereas the government has not exhausted all other legal options;

“Whereas the governing Progressive Conservative Party did not mention changing the number of Toronto city councillors during their 2018 Ontario general election campaign and therefore have no public mandate to pursue Bill 31;

“Whereas the citizens and government of the city of Toronto have not been consulted on Bill 31;

“Whereas Bill 31 undermines Ontario’s judicial system;

“Whereas Bill 31 threatens the charter rights of Ontario citizens;

“We, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to withdraw Bill 31.”

I fully support this petition, and will affix my name to it and hand it to page Hillary to take to the Clerks’ table.

MUNICIPAL ELECTIONS

Ms. Jessica Bell: This petition is entitled “Stop Doug Ford from Interfering in Municipal Elections.”

“To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

“Whereas Doug Ford’s decision to reduce Toronto’s wards from 47 to 25 was made without any public consultation;

“Whereas Doug Ford’s meddling in municipal elections is an abuse of power;

“Whereas Doug Ford is cancelling democratic elections of some regional chairs;

“Therefore we, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to immediately reverse Doug Ford’s unilateral decision to dismantle Toronto city hall

and cancel regional chair elections; to maintain the existing Toronto municipal boundaries; and ensure that the provincial government does not interfere with the upcoming Toronto municipal election for Ford's political gain."

I support this petition. I will be putting my name on this petition and giving it to page Erin.

MUNICIPAL ELECTIONS

Mr. Chris Glover: This petition is entitled "Stop Doug Ford from Interfering in Municipal Elections."

"To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

"Whereas Doug Ford's decision to reduce Toronto's wards from 47 to 25 was made without any public consultation;

"Whereas Doug Ford's meddling in municipal elections is an abuse of power;

"Whereas Doug Ford is cancelling democratic elections of some regional chairs;

"Therefore we, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to immediately reverse Doug Ford's unilateral decision to dismantle Toronto city hall and cancel regional chair elections; to maintain the existing Toronto municipal boundaries; and ensure that the provincial government does not interfere with the upcoming Toronto municipal election for Ford's political gain."

I support this petition. I will sign it and pass it to page Hillary.

CELIAC DISEASE

Ms. Suze Morrison: I would like to present a petition that was given to me by the Canadian Celiac Association. This was sent in by Melissa Secord, who is the executive director there.

"To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

"Whereas the IgA TTG blood screening is the internationally recognized standard as the first step in diagnosing a person with celiac disease;

"Whereas celiac disease is an autoimmune disease that can strike people with a genetic predisposition at any time of life and presents with a large variety of non-specific signs and symptoms;

"Whereas many individuals, such as family members of diagnosed celiacs, are at higher risk and pre-symptomatic screening is advised;

"Whereas covering the cost of the simple test would dramatically reduce wait times to diagnosis, save millions to the health care system due to misdiagnoses, unnecessary testing and serious complications from untreated celiac disease and reduce the painful suffering and health decline of thousands of individuals;

"Whereas Ontario is the only province in Canada not to cover this blood test;

"Therefore we, the undersigned, petition the Ontario government to cover the cost of the diagnostic blood test

(IgA TTG) for celiac disease for those who show symptoms, are a first-degree relative or have an associated condition."

I fully endorse this petition. I will be affixing my signature to it and providing it to usher Erin to deliver to the Clerks. Again, there are more than 100 signatures on this that have been given to me, and I want to thank the Canadian Celiac Association for sharing it with us.

SOCIAL ASSISTANCE

Ms. Judith Monteith-Farrell: I'm happy to present this petition on behalf of many citizens in Thunder Bay.

"Reverse Doug Ford's Cuts to Low-Income Families.

"To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

"Whereas Doug Ford eliminated the Basic Income Pilot project and slashed the new social assistance rates by 1.5%, and did so without warning;

"Whereas cuts to already-meagre social assistance rates will disproportionately impact children, those with mental health challenges, persons with disabilities, and people struggling in poverty;

"Whereas the decision to cancel the Basic Income Pilot project was made without any evidence, and leaves thousands of Ontarians without details about whether they will be able to access other forms of income assistance;

"Whereas the independently authored Income Security: A Roadmap for Change report, presented to the government last fall, recommends both increases to rates and the continuation of the Basic Income Pilot project as key steps towards income adequacy and poverty reduction;

"Whereas the failure to address poverty—and the homelessness, hunger, health crises, and desperation that can result from poverty—hurts people, families and Ontario's communities;

"Therefore we, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to immediately reverse Doug Ford's callous decision to slash increases to social assistance rates by 50%, and reverse his decision to cancel the Basic Income Pilot project, decisions that will undoubtedly hurt thousands of vulnerable people and drag Ontario backwards when it comes to homelessness reduction and anti-poverty efforts."

I am signing this petition and will give to page Hillary.

EMPLOYMENT STANDARDS

Ms. Jill Andrew: Good afternoon, Mr. Speaker. I'm proud to stand today on behalf of the Fight for \$15 and Fairness and Toronto–St. Paul's residents.

The petition is called "Petition to the Ontario Legislative Assembly:

"Don't Take Away Our \$15 Minimum Wage and Fairer Labour Laws."

"Whereas the vast majority of Ontarians support a \$15 minimum wage and better laws to protect workers; and

"Whereas last year, in response to overwhelming popular demand by the people of Ontario, the provincial government brought in legislation and regulations that:

“Deliver 10 personal emergency leave days for all workers, the first two of which are paid;

“Make it illegal to pay part-time, temporary, casual or contract workers less than their full-time or directly hired co-workers, including equal public holiday pay and vacation pay;

“Raised the adult general minimum wage to \$14 per hour and further raises it to a \$15 minimum wage on January 1, 2019, with annual adjustments by Ontario’s consumer price index;

“Make it easier to join unions, especially for workers in the temporary help, home care, community services and building services sectors;

“Make client companies responsible for workplace health and safety for temporary agency employees;

“Provide strong enforcement through the hiring of an additional 175 employment standards officers;

“Will ensure workers have modest improvements in the scheduling of their hours, including:

“—three hours’ pay when workers are expected to be on call all day, but are not called into work;

“—three hours’ pay for any employee whose shift is cancelled with less than two days’ notice; and

“—the right to refuse shifts without penalty if the shift is scheduled with fewer than four days’ notice;

“We, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to honour these commitments, including the \$15 minimum wage and fairer scheduling rules set to take effect on January 1, 2019. We further call on the assembly to take all necessary steps to enforce these laws and extend them to ensure no worker is left without protection.”

I proudly stand here with these signatures—hundreds of them—and I affix my signature. I will hand them over to our page Erin. Thank you, Erin.

EMPLOYMENT STANDARDS

Ms. Marit Stiles: I’m proud to present the petition, “Don’t Take Away Our \$15 Minimum Wage and Fairer Labour Laws.”

“Whereas the vast majority of Ontarians support a \$15 minimum wage and better laws to protect workers; and

“Whereas last year, in response to overwhelming popular demand by the people of Ontario, the provincial government brought in legislation and regulations that:

“Deliver 10 personal emergency leave days for all workers, the first two of which are paid;

“Make it illegal to pay part-time, temporary, casual or contract workers less than their full-time or directly hired

co-workers, including equal public holiday pay and vacation pay;

“Raised the adult general minimum wage to \$14 per hour and further raises it to a \$15 minimum wage on January 1, 2019, with annual adjustments by Ontario’s consumer price index;

“Make it easier to join unions, especially for workers in the temporary help, home care, community services and building services sectors;

“Make client companies responsible for workplace health and safety for temporary agency employees;

“Provide strong enforcement through the hiring of an additional 175 employment standards officers;

“Will ensure workers have modest improvements in the scheduling of their hours, including:

“—three hours’ pay when workers are expected to be on call all day, but are not called into work;

“—three hours’ pay for any employee whose shift is cancelled with less than two days’ notice; and

“—the right to refuse shifts without penalty if the shift is scheduled with fewer than four days’ notice;

“We, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to honour these commitments, including the \$15 minimum wage and fairer scheduling rules set to take effect on January 1, 2019. We further call on the assembly to take all necessary steps to enforce these laws and extend them to ensure no worker is left without protection.”

We’re now only 15 weeks away from the scheduled increase of the minimum wage and fairer scheduling laws. It is not too late for the government to do the right thing. Over 20 communities held local events over the last few days as part of a provincial day of action to defend fair wages. That’s where these petitions come from, and I am proud to support this call. I will affix my name and give these petitions to page Hillary to table for me.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): That concludes the time we have available for petitions this afternoon.

Orders of the day? I recognize the government House leader.

Hon. Todd Smith: Speaker, I move adjournment of the House.

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott): The government House leader has moved the adjournment of the House. Is it the pleasure of the House that the motion carry? Carried on division.

The House stands adjourned until Wednesday at 9 a.m.
The House adjourned at 1333.

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO
ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE DE L'ONTARIO

Lieutenant Governor / Lieutenante-gouverneure: Hon. / L'hon. Elizabeth Dowdeswell, OC, OOnt.
Speaker / Président: Hon. / L'hon. Ted Arnott
Clerk / Greffier: Todd Decker
Deputy Clerk / Sous-greffier: Trevor Day
Clerks-at-the-Table / Greffiers parlementaires: Tonia Grannum, Valerie Quioc Lim, William Short
Sergeant-at-Arms / Sergente d'armes: Jacquelyn Gordon

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Anand, Deepak (PC)	Mississauga—Malton	
Andrew, Jill (NDP)	Toronto—St. Paul's	
Armstrong, Teresa J. (NDP)	London—Fanshawe	Deputy Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjointe de l'opposition officielle
Arnott, Hon. / L'hon. Ted (PC)	Wellington—Halton Hills	Speaker / Président de l'Assemblée législative
Arthur, Ian (NDP)	Kingston and the Islands / Kingston et les Îles	
Baber, Roman (PC)	York Centre / York-Centre	
Babikian, Aris (PC)	Scarborough—Agincourt	
Bailey, Robert (PC)	Sarnia—Lambton	
Barrett, Toby (PC)	Haldimand—Norfolk	
Begum, Doly (NDP)	Scarborough Southwest / Scarborough-Sud-Ouest	
Bell, Jessica (NDP)	University—Rosedale	
Berns-McGown, Rima (NDP)	Beaches—East York / Beaches—East York	
Bethlenfalvy, Hon. / L'hon. Peter (PC)	Pickering—Uxbridge	President of the Treasury Board / Président du Conseil du Trésor
Bisson, Gilles (NDP)	Timmins	Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire de l'opposition officielle
Bouma, Will (PC)	Brantford—Brant	
Bourgouin, Guy (NDP)	Mushkegowuk—James Bay / Mushkegowuk—Baie James	
Burch, Jeff (NDP)	Niagara Centre / Niagara-Centre	
Calandra, Paul (PC)	Markham—Stouffville	
Cho, Hon. / L'hon. Raymond Sung Joon (PC)	Scarborough North / Scarborough-Nord	Minister for Seniors and Accessibility / Ministre des Services aux aînés et de l'Accessibilité
Cho, Stan (PC)	Willowdale	
Clark, Hon. / L'hon. Steve (PC)	Leeds—Grenville—Thousand Islands and Rideau Lakes / Leeds—Grenville—Thousand Islands et Rideau Lakes	Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing / Ministre des Affaires municipales et du Logement
Coe, Lorne (PC)	Whitby	
Coteau, Michael (LIB)	Don Valley East / Don Valley-Est	
Crawford, Stephen (PC)	Oakville	
Cuzzetto, Rudy (PC)	Mississauga—Lakeshore	
Des Rosiers, Nathalie (LIB)	Ottawa—Vanier	
Downey, Doug (PC)	Barrie—Springwater—Oro-Medonte	
Dunlop, Jill (PC)	Simcoe North / Simcoe-Nord	
Elliott, Hon. / L'hon. Christine (PC)	Newmarket—Aurora	Deputy Premier / Vice-première ministre Minister of Health and Long-Term Care / Ministre de la Santé et des Soins de longue durée
Fedeli, Hon. / L'hon. Victor (PC)	Nipissing	Chair of Cabinet / Président du Conseil des ministres Minister of Finance / Ministre des Finances
Fee, Amy (PC)	Kitchener South—Hespeler / Kitchener-Sud—Hespeler	
Fife, Catherine (NDP)	Waterloo	
Ford, Hon. / L'hon. Doug (PC)	Etobicoke North / Etobicoke-Nord	Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs / Ministre des Affaires intergouvernementales Premier / Premier ministre
Fraser, John (LIB)	Ottawa South / Ottawa-Sud	
French, Jennifer K. (NDP)	Oshawa	Third Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Troisième vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Fullerton, Hon. / L'hon. Merrilee (PC)	Kanata—Carleton	Minister of Training, Colleges and Universities / Ministre de la Formation et des Collèges et Universités
Gates, Wayne (NDP)	Niagara Falls	
Gélinas, France (NDP)	Nickel Belt	
Ghamari, Goldie (PC)	Carleton	
Gill, Parm (PC)	Milton	
Glover, Chris (NDP)	Spadina—Fort York	
Gravelle, Michael (LIB)	Thunder Bay—Superior North / Thunder Bay—Supérieur-Nord	
Gretzky, Lisa (NDP)	Windsor West / Windsor-Ouest	First Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Première vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée
Hardeman, Hon. / L'hon. Ernie (PC)	Oxford	Minister of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs / Ministre de l'Agriculture, de l'Alimentation et des Affaires rurales
Harden, Joel (NDP)	Ottawa Centre / Ottawa-Centre	
Harris, Mike (PC)	Kitchener—Conestoga	
Hassan, Faisal (NDP)	York South—Weston / York-Sud— Weston	
Hatfield, Percy (NDP)	Windsor—Tecumseh	Second Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Deuxième vice-président du comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Hillier, Randy (PC)	Lanark—Frontenac—Kingston	
Hogarth, Christine (PC)	Etobicoke—Lakeshore	
Horwath, Andrea (NDP)	Hamilton Centre / Hamilton-Centre	Leader, Official Opposition / Chef de l'opposition officielle
Hunter, Mitzie (LIB)	Scarborough—Guildwood	
Jones, Hon. / L'hon. Sylvia (PC)	Dufferin—Caledon	Minister of Tourism, Culture and Sport / Ministre du Tourisme, de la Culture et du Sport
Kanapathi, Logan (PC)	Markham—Thornhill	
Karahalios, Belinda (PC)	Cambridge	
Karpoche, Bhutla (NDP)	Parkdale—High Park	
Ke, Vincent (PC)	Don Valley North / Don Valley-Nord	
Kernaghan, Terence (NDP)	London North Centre / London- Centre-Nord	
Khanjin, Andrea (PC)	Barrie—Innisfil	
Kramp, Daryl (PC)	Hastings—Lennox and Addington	
Kusendova, Natalia (PC)	Mississauga Centre / Mississauga- Centre	
Lalonde, Marie-France (LIB)	Orléans	
Lecce, Stephen (PC)	King—Vaughan	Deputy Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjoint du gouvernement
Lindo, Laura Mae (NDP)	Kitchener Centre / Kitchener-Centre	
MacLeod, Hon. / L'hon. Lisa (PC)	Nepean	Minister of Children, Community and Social Services / Ministre des Services à l'enfance et des Services sociaux et communautaires Minister Responsible for Women's Issues / Ministre déléguée à la Condition féminine
Mamakwa, Sol (NDP)	Kiiwetinoong	
Mantha, Michael (NDP)	Algoma—Manitoulin	
Martin, Robin (PC)	Eglinton—Lawrence	
Martow, Gila (PC)	Thornhill	
McDonell, Jim (PC)	Stormont—Dundas—South Glengarry	
McKenna, Jane (PC)	Burlington	
McNaughton, Hon. / L'hon. Monte (PC)	Lambton—Kent—Middlesex	Minister of Infrastructure / Ministre de l'Infrastructure
Miller, Norman (PC)	Parry Sound—Muskoka	
Miller, Paul (NDP)	Hamilton East—Stoney Creek / Hamilton-Est—Stoney Creek	
Mitas, Christina Maria (PC)	Scarborough Centre / Scarborough- Centre	
Monteith-Farrell, Judith (NDP)	Thunder Bay—Atikokan	
Morrison, Suze (NDP)	Toronto Centre / Toronto-Centre	
Mulroney, Hon. / L'hon. Caroline (PC)	York—Simcoe	Attorney General / Procureure générale Minister Responsible for Francophone Affairs / Ministre déléguée aux Affaires francophones
Natyshak, Taras (NDP)	Essex	

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Nicholls, Rick (PC)	Chatham-Kent—Leamington	Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Président du comité plénier de l'Assemblée Deputy Speaker / Vice-président
Oosterhoff, Sam (PC)	Niagara West / Niagara-Ouest	
Pang, Billy (PC)	Markham—Unionville	
Park, Lindsey (PC)	Durham	
Parsa, Michael (PC)	Aurora—Oak Ridges—Richmond Hill	
Pettapiece, Randy (PC)	Perth—Wellington	
Phillips, Hon. / L'hon. Rod (PC)	Ajax	Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks / Ministre de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la nature et des Parcs
Piccini, David (PC)	Northumberland—Peterborough South / Northumberland—Peterborough-Sud	
Rakocevic, Tom (NDP)	Humber River—Black Creek	
Rasheed, Kaleed (PC)	Mississauga East—Cooksville / Mississauga-Est—Cooksville	
Rickford, Hon. / L'hon. Greg (PC)	Kenora—Rainy River	Minister of Energy, Northern Development and Mines / Ministre de l'Énergie, du Développement du Nord et des Mines Minister of Indigenous Affairs / Ministre des Affaires autochtones
Roberts, Jeremy (PC)	Ottawa West—Nepean / Ottawa-Ouest—Nepean	
Romano, Ross (PC)	Sault Ste. Marie	
Sabawy, Sheref (PC)	Mississauga—Erin Mills	
Sandhu, Amarjot (PC)	Brampton West / Brampton-Ouest	
Sarkaria, Prabmeet Singh (PC)	Brampton South / Brampton-Sud	
Sattler, Peggy (NDP)	London West / London-Ouest	
Schreiner, Mike (GRN)	Guelph	
Scott, Hon. / L'hon. Laurie (PC)	Haliburton—Kawartha Lakes—Brock	Minister of Labour / Ministre du Travail
Shaw, Sandy (NDP)	Hamilton West—Ancaster—Dundas / Hamilton-Ouest—Ancaster—Dundas	
Simard, Amanda (PC)	Glengarry—Prescott—Russell	
Singh, Gurattan (NDP)	Brampton East / Brampton-Est	
Singh, Sara (NDP)	Brampton Centre / Brampton-Centre	Deputy Leader, Official Opposition / Chef adjointe de l'opposition officielle
Skelly, Donna (PC)	Flamborough—Glanbrook	
Smith, Dave (PC)	Peterborough—Kawartha	
Smith, Hon. / L'hon. Todd (PC)	Bay of Quinte / Baie de Quinte	Minister of Government and Consumer Services / Ministre des Services gouvernementaux et des Services aux consommateurs Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire du gouvernement
Stevens, Jennifer (Jennie) (NDP)	St. Catharines	
Stiles, Marit (NDP)	Davenport	
Surma, Kinga (PC)	Etobicoke Centre / Etobicoke-Centre	
Tabuns, Peter (NDP)	Toronto—Danforth	
Tangri, Nina (PC)	Mississauga—Streetsville	
Taylor, Monique (NDP)	Hamilton Mountain	
Thanigasalam, Vijay (PC)	Scarborough—Rouge Park	
Thompson, Hon. / L'hon. Lisa M. (PC)	Huron—Bruce	Minister of Education / Ministre de l'Éducation
Tibollo, Hon. / L'hon. Michael A. (PC)	Vaughan—Woodbridge	Minister of Community Safety and Correctional Services / Ministre de la Sécurité communautaire et des Services correctionnels
Triantafilopoulos, Effie J. (PC)	Oakville North—Burlington / Oakville-Nord—Burlington	
Vanthof, John (NDP)	Timiskaming—Cochrane	Deputy Leader, Official Opposition / Chef adjoint de l'opposition officielle
Wai, Daisy (PC)	Richmond Hill	
Walker, Bill (PC)	Bruce—Grey—Owen Sound	
West, Jamie (NDP)	Sudbury	
Wilson, Hon. / L'hon. Jim (PC)	Simcoe—Grey	Minister of Economic Development, Job Creation and Trade / Ministre du Développement économique, de la Création d'emplois et du Commerce
Wynne, Kathleen O. (LIB)	Don Valley West / Don Valley-Ouest	
Yakabuski, Hon. / L'hon. John (PC)	Renfrew—Nipissing—Pembroke	Minister of Transportation / Ministre des Transports
Yarde, Kevin (NDP)	Brampton North / Brampton-Nord	
Yurek, Hon. / L'hon. Jeff (PC)	Elgin—Middlesex—London	Minister of Natural Resources and Forestry / Ministre des Richesses naturelles et des Forêts

**STANDING COMMITTEES OF THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY
COMITÉS PERMANENTS DE L'ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE**

Standing Committee on Estimates / Comité permanent des budgets des dépenses

Chair / Président: Peter Tabuns
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Wayne Gates
Stan Cho, Jill Dunlop
John Fraser, Wayne Gates
Stephen Lecce, Gila Martow
Jane McKenna, Judith Monteith-Farrell
Lindsey Park, Randy Pettapiece
Peter Tabuns
Committee Clerk / Greffier: Timothy Bryan

Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Affairs / Comité permanent des finances et des affaires économiques

Chair / Président: Stephen Crawford
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Jeremy Roberts
Ian Arthur, Stan Cho
Stephen Crawford, Doug Downey
Sol Mamakwa, David Piccini
Jeremy Roberts, Sandy Shaw
Donna Skelly
Committee Clerk / Greffier: Timothy Bryan

Standing Committee on General Government / Comité permanent des affaires gouvernementales

Chair / Président: Dave Smith
Vice-Chair / Vice-présidente: Natalia Kusendova
Jessica Bell, Lorne Coe
Chris Glover, Christine Hogarth
Logan Kanapathi, Daryl Kramp
Natalia Kusendova, Amarjot Sandhu
Mike Schreiner, Dave Smith
Jennifer (Jennie) Stevens
Committee Clerk / Greffier: William Short

Standing Committee on Government Agencies / Comité permanent des organismes gouvernementaux

Chair / Président: John Vanthof
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Taras Natyshak
Roman Baber, Rudy Cuzzetto
Amy Fee, Vincent Ke
Andrea Khanjin, Marie-France Lalonde
Taras Natyshak, Rick Nicholls
Jeremy Roberts, Marit Stiles
John Vanthof
Committee Clerk / Greffière: Jocelyn McCauley

Standing Committee on Justice Policy / Comité permanent de la justice

Chair / Président: Parm Gill
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Aris Babikian
Roman Baber, Aris Babikian
Nathalie Des Rosiers, Jill Dunlop
Parm Gill, Lindsey Park
Ross Romano, Prabmeet Singh Sarkaria
Sara Singh, Monique Taylor
Kevin Yarde
Committee Clerk / Greffière: Jocelyn McCauley

Standing Committee on the Legislative Assembly / Comité permanent de l'Assemblée législative

Chair / Présidente: Jane McKenna
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Vijay Thanigasalam
Robert Bailey, Rima Berns-McGown
Michael Coteau, Mike Harris
Faisal Hassan, Jane McKenna
Christina Maria Mitas, Sam Oosterhoff
Amanda Simard, Gurratan Singh
Vijay Thanigasalam
Committee Clerk / Greffière: Valerie Quioc Lim

Standing Committee on Public Accounts / Comité permanent des comptes publics

Chair / Présidente: Catherine Fife
Vice-Chair / Vice-présidente: Peggy Sattler
Catherine Fife, Goldie Ghamari
Jim McDonnell, Norman Miller
Suze Morrison, Michael Parsa
Peggy Sattler, Kinga Surma
Daisy Wai
Committee Clerk / Greffier: Christopher Tyrell

Standing Committee on Regulations and Private Bills / Comité permanent des règlements et des projets de loi d'intérêt privé

Chair / Président: Randy Hillier
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Kaleed Rasheed
Toby Barrett, Will Bouma
Mike Harris, Randy Hillier
Mitzie Hunter, Laura Mae Lindo
Paul Miller, Billy Pang
Kaleed Rasheed, Amarjot Sandhu
Jamie West
Committee Clerk / Greffier: Eric Rennie

Standing Committee on Social Policy / Comité permanent de la politique sociale

Chair / Présidente: Nina Tangri
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Deepak Anand
Deepak Anand, Doly Begum
Jeff Burch, Amy Fee
Michael Gravelle, Joel Harden
Belinda Karahalios, Robin Martin
Sheref Sabawy, Nina Tangri
Effie J. Triantafilopoulos
Committee Clerk / Greffier: Eric Rennie